9/29/2011 1:34 PM

Japantown Better Neighborhood Plan Draft
Chapter Recommendations
Proposed Changes Matrix
September 9, 2011

Chapter 1 – Introduction

Change the name of the plan.

Do not let the environmental review requirements drive the recommendations.

Chapter 2 - Community Heritage

(See complete chapter edits attached.)

Recommendations that should be retained:

1. Establish a Community-based Body to Guide Preservation Efforts.
2. Recognize Important Properties of the Japanese and Japanese American Communities.
3. Encourage the Use of California Historic Building Code.
4. Facilitate Façade Easement program.
5. Develop Community Land Trust.
6. Consider Other Preservation Strategies.

Draft Recommendations	Amendments/Changes	Relevant Information	Issues/Variables
Page 15-23 2.1 Existing Conditions	See Amendments - historic context and community heritage features. - Fix identification of JACL, Nichi Bei Kai, Raphael Weill Buildings. - Review terminology (Shin-Issei, Kibei-Nisei, Shin-Nisei) - Eligible places for National Registry - Include other ethnic history - Update JA demographics. - Page 19 add cultural themes. - Evaluate survey and assessment of		

Draft Recommendations	Amendments/Changes	Relevant Information	Issues/Variables
	historic resources. - Community/Cultural Heritage tourism.		
Page24 2.2 Recommendations and Strategies	Delete a recommendations		
	Community Land Trust	Economics of malls and commercial properties, structural integrity of garage, architectural support.	Discussion Point: Benefits / impacts on property owners.
	Buchanan Mall and Peace Plaza as a cultural heritage area. Expand treatment of Buchanan Mall and Peace Plaza for cultural and community significance.		Ditto
	Look into Cultural Main Street for Post Street		Ditto
	Explore the development and creation of a new cultural preservation legislation		
	Explore the façade easement program		Ditto
	Cultural Economic Development plan for culturally relevant businesses and festival activities	Refer to Comm Econ Dev	
	Using existing planning tools and/or develop new tools to achieve the goal of preserving and sustaining a living vital community that includes its living history		
	Non-Profit Buildings - preserving cultural resources, such as archives. Preserve non-profit buildings that were fundraised by the community		Discussion Point: Educate non-profits of how to finance renovations.
	Use of Public Art - murals on walls in Pplaza - Japanese tiles in Pplaza grounds - Ethnic performing arts cultural and community arts in how we define SF Japantown public space	Refer to Public Realm	Discussion Point: Planning and implementation.
	Community/Cultral Heritage Tourism - work with city agencies to make more affordable to organizers	Refer to Comm Econ Dev	

Draft Recommendations	Amendments/Changes	Relevant Information	Issues/Variables
	Develop cultural landscape and foliage standards	Refer to Public Realm	
	Create youth drop in center		
	Use of special lighting at nite	Refer to Public Realm	

Chapter 3 – Community Economic Development

(See complete chapter edits attached.)

Recommendations that should be retained:

1. Establish Implementation Organization
2. Increase Business Retention Efforts to Address Ongoing Pressures on Existing Businesses
3. Recruit New, Culturally Appropriate Businesses.
4. Improve Access to Community Activities
5. Strengthen Community Organizations Administrative Capacity

Draft Recommendations	Amendments/Changes	Relevant Information	Issues/Priority
	Add: Nihonmachi Roots Survey results	Compilation of Nihonmachi Roots survey by the SFSU students.	Discussion Point: Timing, breadth of survey
	Add: Research and further consideration for Parking Benefit District. Proceeds from such a district would be for landscaping, maintenance, and wayfinding.	Refer to Public Realm Comm	Discussion Point: Pioneering in SF
	Add: Research and further consideration of Mello Roos financing for community land trust and other capital needs.		Discussion point: Assessment of property owners; Pioneering in USA; Related to CLT.
	Add: Research and further consideration of getting allocation of Hotel Room Tax for Jtown cultural tourism programs,	John Noguchi material	Discussion Point: Jtown getting its share of marketing and grant program.

Draft Recommendations	Amendments/Changes	Relevant Information	Issues/Priority
	marketing, and maintenance.		
	Add: Churches have needs for administrative and capacity support, i.e., technology, staffing, fiscal management, and fundraising.		
	Add: Cumulative impacts of and mitigation plans of major construction projects in the area, e.g. 1481 Post, CPMC, Geary BRT must be diligently monitored.	Responded to the CPMC Draft EIR. See letter. The parking needs of the hospital will negatively impact the preservation of culturally-relevant businesses in Jtown.	Discussion Point: Projects that are in process; community benefits.
Page 34 3.1 Existing Conditions Retail Performance	Insert and summarize Retail Sales Report completed by Sabrina Terry, Planning Department intern.		
Page 36 Ownership Transitions	Family businesses may require assistance with transitions as aging owners retire. Add: Community land trust and/or community benefit district should include funding for training and transitions to new owners.	Small Business Commission programs	Discussion Point: Property and business owners.
Page 36 Japan Center Reconstruction	Re-title to Japan Center Construction		
Page 37 Lack of Permanent Space…	Delete entire paragraph		
Page 39 3.2 Recommendations and Strategies – TO ALL RECOMMENDATIONS: (from Chap 9) RESPONSIBLE ENTITIES POTENTIAL FUNDING SOURCES	Add: The implementation of these recommendations will depend on economic conditions and economic growth, and dependent on the ability to leave open other funding vehicles, i.e. community land trust, Mello Roos bond financing, and community benefit districts and/or business improvement districts.		
Page 39	Add:		Discussion Point: Assessment of

Draft Recommendations	Amendments/Changes	Relevant Information	Issues/Priority
	Implementation of a CBD must take into consideration the 2007 effort to develop a preliminary plan and findings and interviews conducted by the JTF. Recommendations included: - assessments were considered too high by most types of property owners, particularly, non-profits and institutions and residents. - Consider commercial properties only and assessments being paid by owners and not passed through to business tenants. - Consider merging with Fillmore Jazz CBD.		property owners and/or tenants.
Page 40 Actions: Create an Implementation Organization…	Delete all after first sentence. Disagree building on an existing organization dedicated to preservation and revitalization of Jtown.		Discussion Point – Why start a new organization?
Page 40 Actions: Expand the Imp Org Board of Directors…	Amend to read as follows: The Imp Org's Board of Directors must fully represent Jtown's stakeholders, including community organizations, businesses, residents, property owners, and others with demonstrated interests in Jtown.		Same
Page 40 Actions: Conduct fundraising campaign…	- Implement CBD formation campaign - Apply for grants from private organizations and public agencies; work with private corporations and business groups that complement, rather than compete with existing Jtown organizations fundraising efforts. Leverage the CBD funding as community match for private foundation funding.		Same
Page 41 Recruit new culturally appropriate businesses….	Delete second action: Hiring a broker is responsibility of property owners, not the community		

Draft Recommendations	Amendments/Changes	Relevant Information	Issues/Priority
	Imp Org.		
Page 42 Actions:	Agree with recommendation. Preliminary survey of churches available space for rent was conducted. It was discovered that some churches have ceased renting space due to onerous insurance cost. It is recommended that further research be done to get insurance from companies that proved favorable rates to non-profits.	Hiroshi Fukuda's memo	
Page 42 Strengthen Community Organizations Administrative Capacity - Actions	Add: - The community needs to support festivals and cultural events to boost fundraising. - The Imp Org should maintain an events calendar.		Discussion Point: Many issues.
Page 42 – 43 Mitigate Impact of Future Japan Center Construction	Move to Chap 8 – Japan Center		

Chapter 4 – Land Use

(See complete chapter edits attached.)
(See Ken Kaji Discussion Points 5/25/10)

Recommendations that should be retained:

1. Activate Ground Floor Spaces
- Improve Street Frontages and Streets with Required Ground Floor Commercial Uses
- Protect Pedestrian and Transit-oriented Street Frontages.
- Promote Life with Outdoor Activities Areas.

Draft Recommendations	Amendments/Changes	Relevant Information	Issues/Variables

Draft Recommendations	Amendments/Changes	Relevant Information	Issues/Variables
(NEW RECOMMENDATION)	**Establish a Japantown NCD (Neighborhood Commercial District Zone) with controls determined through analysis and feedback to date and through further outreach efforts from the community, BNP Organizing Committee and its subcommittees, and Planning Department staff. The NCD will integrate regulations currently established through the SUD (2006), and prescribe additional controls per NCD Planning Code Article 7.** **These include controls for Building Standards, Commercial and Institutional Standards and Uses (Retail Sales and Services, Institutions and Non-Retail Sales and Services), and Residential Standards and Uses.**		
(NEW RECOMMENDATION)	**Establish and reinforce land use regulations that support preservation strategies such as landmarking, historic districts, conservation districts,**		

Draft Recommendations	Amendments/Changes	Relevant Information	Issues/Variables
	etc. as determined by Cultural Heritage subcommittee and Organizing Committee.		
Page 50: The area north of Bush Street as well as existing land uses within the Upper Fillmore Neighborhood Commercial district should not be changed. The community has not expressed any desire to modify the character or allowed uses in these areas.	AMENDMENT - **Apply prevailing planning department guidelines regarding alleys (Planning Code Section 2261.1) to entire BNP area**	Wilmot Alley resident concerned about lack of protections under current RH2 zoning for maintaining scale and ambiance of alleyway, despite current Planning Department guidelines to that affect that have been integrated into zoning codes for other areas of the City.	Applicable to Wilmot, Orden, Austin, Hemlock, and Avery.
Page 50: Create Zone 1/Mixed Residential Zone: : Rezone residential mixed areas currently zoned RM-3 and RM-4 – roughly between Bush and Geary and east of Webster Street – to new Mixed Residential district. - housing, office, religious facilities, schools, child care facilities, senior and assisted living centers, community center and retail allowed. - - commercial uses limited to 2,999 sf on the first floor and no more than 10,0000 sf per parcel.	**NO AMENDMENT**		
(NEW RECOMMENDATION)	**Establish and reinforce land use regulations that support preservation strategies such as landmarking, historic districts, conservation districts,**		

Draft Recommendations	Amendments/Changes	Relevant Information	Issues/Variables
	etc. as determined by Cultural Heritage subcommittee and Organizing Committee.		
The area north of Bush Street as well as existing land uses within the Upper Fillmore Neighborhood Commercial district should not be changed. The community has not expressed any desire to modify the character or allowed uses in these areas.	AMENDMENT - **Apply prevailing planning department guidelines regarding alleys (Planning Code Section 2261.1) to entire BNP area**	Wilmot Alley resident concerned about lack of protections under current RH2 zoning for maintaining scale and ambiance of alleyway, despite current Planning Department guidelines to that affect that have been integrated into zoning codes for other areas of the City.	Applicable to Wilmot, Orden, Austin, Hemlock, and Avery.
Create Zone 1/Mixed Residential Zone: : Rezone residential mixed areas currently zoned RM-3 and RM-4 – roughly between Bush and Geary and east of Webster Street – to new Mixed Residential district. - housing, office, religious facilities, schools, child care facilities, senior and assisted living centers, community center and retail allowed. - - commercial uses limited to 2,999 sf on the first floor and no more than 10,0000 sf per parcel.	**NO AMENDMENT**		
Page 50: Create Zone 2/Neighborhood Commercial Zone: Replace residential mixed area currently zoned RM-3 and the neighborhood commercial area currently zoned NC-2 with new district to encourage existing neighborhood-serving retail	AMENDMENT - Replace residential mixed area currently zoned RM-3 and the neighborhood commercial area currently zoned NC-2 with new **NCD** zone to encourage existing neighborhood-serving retail core to	International Formula Retail defined as a type of retail sales activity or retail sales establishment which, along with eleven or more other retail sales establishments located outside of the United States, maintains two or more of the following features: a standardized array of merchandise, a standardized facade, a standardized decor and	Special Use District (2006) conditional use authorization requirement for change of use in excess of 4,000 sf superseded by Zone 2 / conditional use authorization for new formula retail (no sf threshold).

Draft Recommendations	Amendments/Changes	Relevant Information	Issues/Variables
core to flourish. - residential above first floor - retail up to 2,999 sf on first two floors, and up to 10,000 sf commercial per parcel allowed. - restaurants with bars, theaters, business and professional services, general office (above first floor), and art activities allowed. - conditional use authorization required for new religious facilities, schools, child care facilities, tourist hotels, fast food, bars, and formula retail - Liquor sales limited according to type: stores selling liquor (most limited); bars swelling liquor for onsite consumption (limited); restaurants selling liquor for onsite consumption (least limited)	flourish. **Prescribe specific regulations, per article 7 of the Planning Code, including but not limited to 2006 SUD regulations**. - residential above first floor - retail up to 2,999 sf on first two floors, and up to10,000 sf commercial per parcel allowed. - restaurants with bars, theaters, business and professional services, general office (above first floor), and art activities allowed. - conditional use authorization required for new religious facilities, schools, child care facilities, tourist hotels, fast food, bars, and **national and international formula retail** - Liquor sales limited according to type: stores selling liquor (most limited); bars swelling liquor for onsite consumption (limited); restaurants selling liquor for onsite consumption (least limited)		
Page 50: Create Zone 3/Regional	AMENDMENT - Replace NC3 along the north side of Geary between Avery	International Formula Retail defined as a type of retail sales activity or retail sales establishment which, along with eleven or more other retail sales establishments	Special Use District (2006) conditional use authorization requirement for change of

Draft Recommendations	Amendments/Changes	Relevant Information	Issues/Variables
Commercial Zone: Replace NC3 along the north side of Geary between Avery and Laguna, with a new zone to encourage the Japan Center malls and parcels along Geary to maximize potential as a regional serving commercial destination. - residential (above first floor) - retail up to 2,999 sf on the first three floors with no limit per parcel - bars, nighttime entertainment, theaters, business And professional services above the first floor, and arts activities - Conditional use permit required for new religious facilities, schools, child care facilities, tourist hotels, fast food, formula retail uses, and retail above 3,000 sf - Liquor sales limited according to type (same as Zone 2): stores selling liquor (most limited); bars swelling liquor for onsite consumption (limited); restaurants selling liquor for onsite consumption (least limited)	and Laguna, with a new **NCD** zone to encourage the Japan Center malls and parcels along Geary to maximize potential as a regional serving commercial destination. **Prescribe specific regulations, per article 7 of the Planning Code, including but not limited to 2006 SUD regulations.** - residential (above first floor) - retail up to 2,999 sf on the first three floors with no limit per parcel - bars, nighttime entertainment, theaters, business and professional services above the first floor, and arts activities - Conditional use permit required for new religious facilities, schools, child care facilities, tourist hotels, fast food, **national and international formula retail uses**, and retail above 3,000 sf - Liquor sales limited according to type (same as Zone 2): stores selling liquor (most limited); bars swelling liquor for onsite consumption (limited); restaurants selling liquor for onsite consumption	located outside of the United States, maintains two or more of the following features: a standardized array of merchandise, a standardized facade, a standardized decor and color scheme, a uniform apparel, standardized signage, a trademark or a servicemark.	use in excess of 4,000 sf superseded by Zone 3 / 3,000 sf threshold.

Draft Recommendations	Amendments/Changes	Relevant Information	Issues/Variables
	(least limited)		
Page 52: Revised residential and parking standards: - No residential off-street parking for new housing units - Maximum of 1 parking space per new housing unit for Zones 1 and 2 - Maximum of .75 parking spaces per new housing unit permitted in Zone 1 - No new parking lots - Conditional use authorization for new parking structures	AMENDMENT - change to: - No residential off-street parking for new housing units - Maximum of 1.5 parking space per new housing unit for Zones 1, 2, and 3 **- Parking standards for housing in Zone 3 established by CLT** - No new parking lots - Conditional use authorization for new parking structures, **with incentives for residential-serving parking in BNP area**	According to a survey conducted by NihonmachiROOTS organization, more than 75% of respondents visited Japantown by car. Japantown is also a regional cultural destination, particularly during cultural festivals. In a 2004 SF Chronicle article "San Francisco's Housing Element -- Built on Misunderstanding", Transit Villages in the 21st Century author and transportation authority Michael Bernick writes that the SF Planning Department's Housing Element, incorrectly equates rail transit – such as BART and Caltrain – with the City's light rail and bus and warns that **pressure to absorb and increase housing density and reduce parking requirements through new transit-based communities should be accommodated in the city's emerging central waterfront and Southern areas, NOT its fragile built communities.** (http://www.sfgate.com/cgi-bin/article.cgi?f=/c/a/2004/11/23/EDGQT9UPUL1.DTL)	Amendment aligns zoning controls with: 1) community priorities for family housing (see next item) 2) Japantown as a regional cultural and shopping destination
Page 52: Revised housing requirements for new development: prioritize housing for families: - In other parts of the city, family housing has been encouraged by requiring 40% of new units to contain at least 2-bedrooms; 30% of new units to contain at least 3-bedrooms; or all affordable units to contain at least 2-bedrooms. - There should be no density limit on dwelling units: the unit mix and building height would determine	AMENDMENT - change to: **- 40% of new units to contain at least 2-bedrooms for any new development (ground up or building addition) of 6 units or more** - There should be no density limit on dwelling units: the unit mix and building height would determine the number of units allowed on each parcel		

Draft Recommendations	Amendments/Changes	Relevant Information	Issues/Variables
the number of units allowed on each parcel			
Page 52: Property owners should be encouraged to retain existing community-serving uses (facilities and institutions) with incentives such as height bonuses for properties that retain existing community space.	AMENDMENT - **Eliminate this recommendation. Height bonuses above existing limits should not be used as an incentive for properties that retain existing community space.**	Determination of potential incentives to retain existing community-serving uses -- such as transfer of development rights, Community Land Trust incentives, and special programs -- pending results of studies and other chapter amendments.	Development of a CLT is being studied. Its feasibility has not yet been determined.
Page 52: Enhanced neighborhood notification for conditional use authorization to ensure land use and character compatibility	AMENDMENT - **Any change in use and new development, or expansion of existing building envelope within NCD / SUD shall require notice pursuant to section 312. Furthermore, posted notice shall be in locations easily visible to members of the public and shall be posted, at a minimum, on Geary Boulevard, Post Street, and Webster Street, Fillmore Street, or Laguna Street.**	Amendment consistent with 2006 SUD requirements, to be incorporated in Japantown NCD.	
<u>Page 52:</u> <u>Activate Ground Floor Spaces</u> – Japantown's commercial areas should be protected from physical intrusions .... that interfere with an active walkable experience. The Planning Code has several existing requirements for commercial streets that should	AMENDMENT – change to the following: ...Active ground floor use and protected street frontage requirements should be applied to the following streets in Japantown: - Post Street btwn	Fillmore Street is subject to zoning controls of the Upper Fillmore Neighborhood Commercial District from California to Bush Streets.	

Draft Recommendations	Amendments/Changes	Relevant Information	Issues/Variables
be active, pedestrian-oriented and walkable. The intent of these requirements is summarized below and should be applied to Japantown's commercial corridors depicted in Figure 4.2 on page 51. Active ground floor use and protected street frontage requirements should be applied to the following streets in Japantown: - Post Street btwn Fillmore and Laguna Streets - Geary Boulevard btwn Steiner and Laguna Streets - Fillmore Street for the extent of the Plan Area - Buchanan Street btwn Post and Bush Streets - Webster Street btwn Geary and Post Street - Laguna Street btwn Geary and Hemlock Street	Fillmore and Laguna Streets - Geary Boulevard btwn Steiner and Laguna Streets - Buchanan Street btwn Post and Bush Streets **- Fillmore Street btwn Bush and Ellis Streets** - Webster Street btwn Geary Boulevard and Post Street - Laguna Street btwn Geary Boulevard and Hemlock Street		
Page 53: Improve street frontages and streets with required ground floor commercial uses – In order to preserve, enhance and promote street frontages that are pedestrian-oriented, lively, fine-grained and provide opportunity for multiple shops and services to serve both local and citywide populations, a number of requirements have been identified and are summarized below, pursuant	AMENDMENT – Improve street frontages and streets with required ground floor commercial uses – In order to preserve, enhance and promote street frontages that are pedestrian-oriented, lively, finegrained and provide opportunity for multiple shops and services to serve both local and citywide populations, a	South facing walls may require tinting to protect merchandise from sun damage	

Draft Recommendations	Amendments/Changes	Relevant Information	Issues/Variables
to Planning Code Sections 145.1 and 145.4): a) above grade parking to be set back at least 25 ft on the ground floor and 15 ft at all other levels from any facade facing a street b) ground floor commercial uses shall occupy no less than 75% of building frontages and shall be open at the pedestrian eye level, allowing visibility to the inside of the building, using clear, untinted glass except for decorative architectural accents. Any decorative railings or grillework, other than wire mesh, placed in front of or behind such windows shall be at least 75% open to perpendicular view. c) active uses at ground floor includes those that are oriented to public access and walk-up pedestrian activity and shall not include any use whose primary function is the storage of goods, or vehicles, utility installations, any office use any use related to motorized vehicles, or any use or portion of a use requiring non-transparent walls facing a public street.	number of requirements have been identified and are summarized below, pursuant to Planning Code Sections 145.1 and 145.4): a) above grade parking to be set back at least 25 ft on the ground floor and 15 ft at all other levels from any facade facing a street b) ground floor commercial uses shall occupy no less than 75% of building frontages and shall be open at the pedestrian eye level, allowing visibility to the inside of the building, using clear, untinted glass, **with the exception of south facing walls and decorative architectural accents, such as operable shoji doors.** Any decorative railings or grillework, other than wire mesh, placed in front of or behind such windows shall be at least 75% open to perpendicular view.		
Page 53: Protect Pedestrian and transit oriented street frontages – In order to preserve the	AMENDMENT -- **Committee feels "Office use, any use related to motorized vehicles, or**		

Draft Recommendations	Amendments/Changes	Relevant Information	Issues/Variables
pedestrian character of commercial districts and to minimize delays to transit service, garage entries, driveways or other vehicular access to off-street parking or loading shall be regulated on development lots within Japantown's commercial corridors (see Planning Code Section 155r for more detailed explanation)	**any use or portion of a use requiring non-transparent walls facing a public street" should be further vetted with the public.**		
Page 53: Promote street life with outdoor activity areas – Outdoor activities which promote street life and do not detract from livability should be encouraged and permitted in the proposed Japantown Zone 2 and Zone 3 (see Planning Code Section 145.2 for more detailed explanation)	NO AMENDMENT (PHW Comment – Haven't we done away with zone 1/2/3 concept??)		

Chapter 5 – Built Form

(See complete chapter edits attached.)
(See Ken Kaji Architectural / Visual Survey Tour memo 8/26/10)

Recommendations that should be retained:

1. Apply Jtown-specific Design Guidelines
- form and structure
- roofs
- materials and ornamentation
- landscaping open spaces and public art.

Draft Recommendations	Amendments/Changes	Relevant Information	Issues/Variables
Page 62: 1. Update Japantown's building heights and large parcel development controls to improve the neighborhoods' livability and walkability while harmoniously complementing the city's larger urban pattern and skyline.	AMENDMENT– Keep heights close to current zoning with moderate increases allowed in the commercial core. Large parcel development controls relevant to Japan Center super blocks only.	Large scale and highrise development is not compatible with community goals for Japantown, nor does it promote the livability and walkability of the neighborhood. Maintaining existing building height limits is in keeping with the Urban Design Element of the San Francisco General Plan for heights of buildings (Policy 3.5) along hillsides and in valleys.	See more on building heights and large parcel development controls on pages 4 - 6.
Page 62: 2. Apply the City's recently established design guidelines to improve the quality of site and building design and the impact it has on the public realm. These guidelines will be applied throughout the city's neighborhoods which have undergone recent planning. This chapter describes their intent and how they should be applied in Japantown.	AMENDMENT - Guidelines and recommendations from San Francisco's General Plan may be applied in instances where they align with the goals of the Japantown BNP. Japantown Design Guidelines and to supersede SF General Plan policies where there may be a conflict.	San Francisco's General Plan prescribes a multitude of goals and recommendations for 10 planning elements including Urban Design, Housing, and Transportation. These guidelines cannot supersede Zoning regulations and planning code as	Applicable to Wilmot, Orden, Austin, Hemlock, and Avery. PHW Query: Orben or Orden?
Page 62: 3. Apply Japantown-Specific Design Guidelines to ensure the neighborhood's special character is enhanced over time. There are specific aspects of Japantown's unique	AMENDMENT – Revise Japantown-Specific Design Guidelines in BNP (pages 69 - 79) to reconcile issues affecting Land Use, Built Form, Community Heritage, and Public Realm chapters and recommendations. Design Guidelines shall include	Revised Japantown-Specific Design Guidelines to be developed in Partnership with and through a grant with SF Architectural Heritage and in collaboration with the Planning Department. This effort is underway.	Revised Design Guidelines to integrate landscape design and also address special considerations for landmarking and/or historic and conservation districts.

Draft Recommendations	Amendments/Changes	Relevant Information	Issues/Variables
character that are not addressed by the citywide guidelines. To respond to Japantown's eclectic mix of urban design conditions and the neighborhood's Japanese character, a set of additional guidelines has been developed to be applicable to Japantown only.	standards for environmental stewardship, including but not limited to USGBC LEED benchmarks for sustainable design. PHW COMMENT: Mandatory DR if not at LEED Gold or better? LEED Gold is well within reach of any project; minimal capital cost increase well covered by lower operating cost if competent design /build team		
Page 63: Update Building Heights – When looking at building heights, the impact on the ground level, the neighborhood scale and the skyline must be considered. The following policies have been established to protect San Francisco's unique skyline and livable neighborhoods. They should be adhered to in Japantown as well: - Develop a distinctive skyline form that compliments the city's skyline, including downtown, the natural landform, the waterfront, and the bay, and	AMENDMENT - Retain existing building heights with moderate increases allowed through conditional use approval (Japan Center Malls). Policies from San Francisco's General Plan should be adhered to only in instances where they align with articulated community goals for Japantown and the Japantown BNP. - Because much of Japantown (particularly the commercial core), is situated along slopes of hillsides and in the valley bowl delineated by Lafayette Park, Anza Park, and Alamo Square, low, smaller-scale buildings are recommended and in keeping with the SF General Plan Guidelines for Major New Development. Low buildings also respect the	San Francisco's Japantown is the oldest of only three remaining Japantowns in the United States. It embodies not only the history of an ethnic enclave, but also the history of San Francisco's Western Addition and the history of the United States. Its preservation should not be sacrificed to apply newly adopted policies in San Francisco's General Plan. A study of Japantown's Existing Zoning Build Out Potential by the Planning Department determined that existing zoning for the Plan Area can absorb about 45 years of new residential development and 46 years of new commercial development, based on the historical build out rate between 1990 and 2010. San Francisco General Plan Guidelines for Major New Development, states "Low, smaller-scale buildings on the slopes of hills, at their base and in the valleys between complement topographic forms and permit uninterrupted views". (http://www.sf-planning.org/ftp/General_Plan/I5_Urban_Design.htm). In her 2010 graduate thesis for UC Berkeley's MUD program (This is Japantown, Reconnecting A Community, Redefining An Identity), Lisa Liu notes	Proposed 375+ foot tower on the eastern half of the block bound by Gough, Geary, Laguna and Post and increased allowable building height on the western half of the same block DOES NOT support San Francisco General Plan Guidelines for Major New Development, particularly respecting the natural topography of the hill.

Draft Recommendations	Amendments/Changes	Relevant Information	Issues/Variables
responds to existing policies in the Urban Design Element of the General Plan. - Respect the natural topography and follow the policies already established in the General Plan's Urban Design Element that allow increased height on the top of hills. - Maintain view corridors through the area by means of height and bulk and tower spacing controls that ensure carefully spaced slender towers rather than bulky, massive buildings. - Ensure adequate light and air to the district and minimize wind and shadow impacts on public streets and open spaces.	natural topography of the site. - Maintain view corridors throughout the area by prohibiting new towers in the BNP Planning Area that would obscure views not only down to the streets, but also from the valleys looking up toward the hillsides. - Ensure adequate light and air to the district and minimize wind and shadow impacts on public streets and open spaces.	Japantown's location in a topographical "bowl" with views towards hills anchored by Lafayette Park, Alamo Square, and Alta Plaza Park. This is in keeping with urban design traditions in Japan. Her thesis proposes its preservation and enhancement as a meaningful urban design concept for Japantown. http://mud.ced.berkeley.edu/thesis/2010	
Page 64: Increase Heights along Geary Boulevard – The more significant height limits are recommended on the large parcels between Post Street and Geary Boulevard. These	AMENDMENT – Delete this recommendation.	The width of Geary and its divisive effect on the community (Page 13 of the DRAFT BNP) is widely acknowledged as one of the biggest mistakes of Redevelopment. Increasing building heights on the north and south sides of Geary between Fillmore and Gough, as proposed by the DRAFT BNP would: - Exacerbate and reinforce the "Geary Divide" by	Update communication and integration with Geary Rapid Transit Corridor planning measures.

Draft Recommendations	Amendments/Changes	Relevant Information	Issues/Variables
parcels that front on the very wide Geary Boulevard (approximately 170 feet wide on the stretch through Japantown), are appropriately for taller buildings, and are the primary place where the neighborhood can successfully accommodate new and denser development in order to meet the city and regions' housing needs, increase community/commercial activity and improve connections between the neighborhoods. The blocks that meet these criteria fall between Fillmore and Gough Streets. . Based on street width, topography, parcel size, adjacent building heights and scale, and preliminary shadow analysis, height limits should be modified on Geary Boulevard. Appropriate base heights along Geary Boulevard are 85 feet; appropriate base heights along Post Street remain at 45 feet		creating even taller streetwalls. - Obscure views down to streets, up towards hillsides, and "into" Japantown's commercial core from Geary, including views to the Japantown Pagoda Landmark. - Conflict with San Francisco General Plan Guidelines for Major New Development, in the following areas: respecting topography and casting shadows on plazas or parks (Peace Plaza). In a 2004 SF Chronicle article San Francisco's Housing Element -- Built on Misunderstanding, Transit Villages in the 21st Century author and transportation authority Michael Bernick writes that the SF Planning Department's Housing Element, incorrectly equates rail transit – such as BART and Caltrain – with the City's light rail and bus. He also warns that pressure to accommodate and increase housing density and reduce parking requirements through new transit-based communities should be accommodated in the city's emerging central waterfront and Southern areas, NOT its fragile built communities. (http://www.sfgate.com/cgi-bin/article.cgi?f=/c/a/2004/11/23/EDGQT9UPUL1.DTL)	

Draft Recommendations	Amendments/Changes	Relevant Information	Issues/Variables
(east of Laguna) and 55 feet (west of Laguna in the commercial area). This stretch of Geary currently has a few towers which mark the corridor and Japantown as an important center of activity and transportation corridor. New tower heights should be tailored to enhance the topography on the skyline, and should be staggered in height and location. Appropriate New tower heights should be tailored to enhance the topography on the skyline, and should be staggered in height and location. Appropriate tower heights within these block range have been determined to be between 135 feet to 375 feet; specific ranges for each location are noted on Figure 5.5: Proposed Building Heights. Further shadow and wind studies will be necessary for each new development prior			

Draft Recommendations	Amendments/Changes	Relevant Information	Issues/Variables
to approval.			
Page 64: Increase Heights at Gateways – The height limits on the parcels at the northern gateway to Japantown (on the Northeast corner of Sutter and Buchanan streets across from the torii gate) should be increased from 50 feet to 85 feet. This additional height is desirable to balance the heights of the property on the east side of Buchanan Street (Hotel Tomo) to strengthen and mark the intersection as Japantown's northern Gateway. Japantown's other gateways (noted in Chapter 6: Public Realm) are already zoned for taller buildings or have parcels that are too small to accommodate more height	AMENDMENT – Delete this recommendation	The committee could not find empirical evidence that midrise or highrise buildings flanking an important intersection reinforces urban gateways	
Page 64: Increase Ground-Floor Heights for Commercial Uses – The City has established policies that encourage more active and attractive ground floor space. One of them gives a five-foot height	NO AMENDMENT		

Draft Recommendations	Amendments/Changes	Relevant Information	Issues/Variables
bonus to buildings which meet the definition of "active ground floor" use per the Planning Code. To encourage generous ground floor heights all parcels in Japantown currently zoned at 50-foot height limit should be increased to 55-feet if they meet the definition of "active ground floor" use and a minimum ground floor to second floor dimension of 12 to 15 feet is maintained - higher ground floors result in more attractive, bright, and usable retail spaces.			
Page 66: Require Step Backs in Japantown's Commercial Core – A parcel's height limit is the maximum height allowed on the parcel, however, to ensure sun access buildings should step back from the property line or building edge above 35 - 45 feet in order to avoid the "canyon effect" and ensure sunlight access to the sidewalks on the north side of the streets. - The parcels fronting on	AMENDMENT – Require Step Backs in Japantown's Commercial Core – A parcel's height limit is the maximum height allowed on the parcel, however, to ensure sun access buildings should step back from the property line or building edge **above 35 feet** in order to avoid the "canyon effect" and ensure sunlight access to the sidewalks on the north side of the streets. - The parcels fronting on Buchanan Mall between Post and Sutter streets should step back by 15 feet at 35 feet to		

Draft Recommendations	Amendments/Changes	Relevant Information	Issues/Variables
Buchanan Mall between Post and Sutter streets should step back by 15 feet at 35 feet to allow for sun access on the pedestrian mall - New development along Post street should step back by 15 feet at 45 feet in height to allow for sun access on the north side of the street.	allow for sun access on the pedestrian mall - New development along Post street should step back by 15 feet at **35 feet** in height to allow for sun access on the north side of the street.		
Page 67: IMPROVE LARGE PARCEL DESIGN In effort to provide more housing opportunities, create an esthetically pleasing ground-floor environment and better connect Japantown to the South of Geary Boulevard, it is necessary to reconsider how the large parcels adjacent to Geary can be redesigned to reinvigorate the neighborhood. The following policies have been established to create livable, mixed-use neighborhoods in other areas of the city. They should be adhered to in Japantown as well:	AMENDMENT – IMPROVE LARGE PARCEL DESIGN In the effort to enhance housing opportunities, create an aesthetically pleasing ground-floor environment, and better connect Japantown to the South of Geary Boulevard, **the following measures should be used to guide large parcel design, including opportunities for the upgrade, renovation and development of the Japan Center Malls (so long as they do not trigger significant disruption, relocation, and jeopardy to existing businesses):** **- Re-establish the continuity of the street grid and historic neighborhood scale by diminishing solid massing of large parcels and existing superblocks. Strategies**	Large scale redesign and development of the Japan Center Malls (entailing significant disruption, relocation, and jeopardy to existing businesses) is not recommended per amendments to Japan Center chapter. Large scale development/height and base building configurations adjacent to Geary and based on the width of Geary is not recommended (see Page 4 of this summary).	

Draft Recommendations	Amendments/Changes	Relevant Information	Issues/Variables
- Relate the height and bulk of base buildings to the width of the street, to define a consistent street wall and ensure adequate sun and sky access to streets and alleys - Provide quality housing in a pleasant environment that has adequate access to light, air, open-space and neighborhood amenities, and that is buffered from excessive noise. - Preserve and enhance the character and scale of finely-grained residential areas within the Japantown area.	**include but are not limited to increased transparency, midblock pedestrian pathways, and prohibiting monotony in street elevation.** **- Housing opportunities should provide** a pleasant environment that has adequate access to light, air, open-space and neighborhood amenities, and that is buffered from excessive noise. - Preserve and enhance the character and scale of finely-grained residential areas within the Japantown area.		
Page 68: Improve Tower Design – Height, bulk, and tower spacing controls are essential means of meeting the design objectives relating to towers. The number, arrangement and form of towers in an area determine the amount of light and air that reach residential units, streets, and open spaces, and the sense of crowding at	AMENDMENT - Improve Tower Design – Height, bulk, and tower spacing controls are essential means to meeting the design objectives relating to towers **allowable under current building height limits**. The number, arrangement and form of towers in an area determine the amount of light and air that reach residential units, streets, and open spaces, and the sense of crowding at street level. Japantown is a residential mixed-use		

Draft Recommendations	Amendments/Changes	Relevant Information	Issues/Variables
street level. Japantown is a residential mixed-use neighborhood, not an office district, and the presence of towers must be tailored to support a living environment. The height and bulk of large development projects should conform to the following tower design policies:	neighborhood, not an office district, and the presence of towers must be tailored to support a living environment. The height and bulk of high rise projects should conform to the following tower design policies:		
Improve Tower Design – CONTINUED - Minimize shadows on streets, open spaces and residential units and the creation of surface winds near the base of buildings - Vary tower heights to avoid the visual "benching" created by a number of buildings whose tops are at the same elevation and to enhance the natural topography on the skyline. - Sculpt tower tops to allow for architectural elements and to screen mechanical equipment - Minimize tower bulk to	Improve Tower Design – CONTINUED - Minimize shadows on streets, open spaces and residential units and the creation of surface winds near the base of buildings - Vary tower heights to avoid the visual "benching" created by a number of buildings whose tops are at the same elevation and to enhance the natural topography on the skyline. - Sculpt tower tops to allow for architectural elements and to screen mechanical equipment - Minimize tower bulk to the dimensions shown in Figure 5.9: Tower Bulk Controls, to ensure a feasible tower floor plate, to create elegant, slender towers and to preserve views		

Draft Recommendations	Amendments/Changes	Relevant Information	Issues/Variables
the dimensions shown in Figure 5.9: Tower Bulk Controls, to ensure a feasible tower floor plate, to create elegant, slender towers and to preserve views and exposure to light and air. - In general, require towers to be spaced approximately 100 feet apart and adhere to the maximum plan dimensions (per Figure 5.9) to minimize shadowing of streets and open space, and to preserve at least as much sky plane as tower bulk. - Allow no more than two towers per block (or three tower per super block), to optimize exposure to light and air from residential units, streets and spaces.	and exposure to light and air. - In general, require towers to be spaced approximately 100 feet apart and adhere to the maximum plan dimensions (per Figure 5.9) to minimize shadowing of streets and open space, and to preserve at least as much sky plane as tower bulk. - **Allow no more than one tower per block** to optimize exposure to light and air from residential units, streets and open spaces.		
<u>Page 69:</u> <u>Require Mid-block Pedestrian Connections</u> – Reduce the existing auto-oriented scale of the streets by creating a circulation network through the interior blocks, creating a street	NO AMENDMENT		

Draft Recommendations	Amendments/Changes	Relevant Information	Issues/Variables
scale comparable to those in existing residential areas elsewhere in the City. This should be achieved in Japantown by creating safe, inviting and publicly accessible north-south pedestrian pathways through super blocks (examples of other pedestrian connections are pictured right and below). The connections should be made in close alignment with the original street right of way.			
Page 69: APPLY JAPANTOWN-SPECIFIC GUIDELINES As described in the existing conditions section, Japantown displays an eclectic mix of buildings styles, open spaces, landscaping, and public art that contribute to a unique neighborhood character. Japanese -inspired design is an element that adds to Japantown's built environment. The following Japantown-Specific Design Guidelines were	AMENDMENT – **TBD** (Revise and refine DRAFT Japantown-Specific Guidelines to support Japantown BNP Goals, based on : - public input regarding current recommendations/ amendments to DRAFT BNP - integration and reconciliation of issues and impacts from Community Heritage, Land Use, Built Form, and Public Realm Chapters [eg. landmarking, streetscape, delineation of special districts, etc.])	Guidelines will be developed in partnership with SF Heritage (grant) and in collaboration with SF Planning Department. Overall integration and harmony of historic and contemporary design elements is a priority. Guidelines should include benchmarks/ measures to maximize environmentally sustainable development.	

Draft Recommendations	Amendments/Changes	Relevant Information	Issues/Variables
developed in order to encourage culturally relevant architecture in new building/site designs and in renovations and additions to older buildings/sites. The Japantown-Specific Design Guidelines are intended to promote, maintain, and accentuate the authentically expressive qualities of Japanese-inspired designed that contribute to the uniqueness of Japantown. Nothing in these Japantown-Specific Design guidelines should be interpreted as limiting new development to specific architectural styles, periods of construction, or cultural expressions. . . The Japantown-Specific Design guidelines apply to properties within the blocks bounded by Sutter Street, Geary Boulevard, Fillmore Street and Laguna Street. The Japantown-Specific Design Guidelines may also be applied to major development projects			

Draft Recommendations	Amendments/Changes	Relevant Information	Issues/Variables
located anywhere within the Plan Area based upon recommendations based upon community input. The application of the Japantown-Specific Design Guidelines should consider property-specific characteristics such as setting (including adjacent and nearby properties), pre-existing conditions (in the case of renovation, addition, or new construction following demolition), and project objectives (including use and function).			
Page 69: Form and Structure – Use exposed structural (or structural like) elements (including wood, concrete, and/or steel materials) in new construction, renovations and additions to existing buildings as appropriate to specific building designs and their settings.	See Apply Japantown-Specific Guidelines above.		
Page 70: Roofs – Use gabled or pent roofs (or sections thereof), and related features such as overhanging eaves,	See Apply Japantown-Specific Guidelines on Page 8 of this summary.		

Draft Recommendations	Amendments/Changes	Relevant Information	Issues/Variables
exposed structural members, tiles, shingles thatching, or elements that resemble such in new construction, renovations, and additions to existing buildings as appropriate to specific buildings designs and their settings. The integration of such roofs should relate to the scale of the building and should be used cautiously to avoid appearing superficial.			
Page 71: Materials and Ornamentation - Use wood as a primary cladding or ornamental material in new construction, renovations and additions to existing building, especially where it will complement adjacent and nearby properties. Another common building materials is white plaster or stucco, often used as wall cladding in conjunction with half-timbering to evoke a Japanese traditional style.	See Apply Japantown-Specific Guidelines on Page 8 of this summary.		

Draft Recommendations	Amendments/Changes	Relevant Information	Issues/Variables
Reference Japanese architectural styles by placement, shape, and relationship of design elements in buildings that utilize modern materials such as concrete, metal and plate glass. - Use building materials such as wood, stucco, concrete, metal and plate glass to suit specific building designs and their settings as well as to complement and enhance an expression of Japantown's cultural character.			
Page 72: Landscaping, Open Spaces, and Public Art – Integrate plant species, objects, materials and/or techniques in new or renovated landscaping, open spaces, and public art to complement and enhance an expression of Japantown's cultural character; improvements should not be limited specifically to use of Japanese-influenced design	See Apply Japantown-Specific Guidelines on Page 8 of this summary.		
Page 73: Apply San Francisco's Citywide Design	See Apply Japantown-Specific Guidelines on Page 8 of this summary. Policies from San	San Francisco's Japantown is the oldest of only three remaining Japantowns in the United States. It embodies not only the history of an ethnic enclave, but	

Draft Recommendations	Amendments/Changes	Relevant Information	Issues/Variables
Guidelines – The purpose of the citywide design guidelines is to improve the city's aesthetic quality and to ensure all development supports an active, diverse and vibrant public realm. A fundamental principle guiding San Francisco's urban design is the priority the City places on buildings to meet human needs, primarily defined from the pedestrian perspective. The guidelines are intended to: Result in a more coherent architectural landscape. - Improve upon the current neighborhood image. Encourage new development to be more consistent with the neighborhood's and San Francisco's roots. These guidelines will guide new construction and significant alterations to buildings within the	Francisco's General Plan should be adhered to only in instances where they align with articulated community goals for Japantown and the Japantown BNP.	also the history of San Francisco's Western Addition and the history of the United States. Its preservation should not be sacrificed to apply newly adopted policies in San Francisco's General Plan.	

Draft Recommendations	Amendments/Changes	Relevant Information	Issues/Variables
Japantown Plan Area to ensure that plans meet the neighborhood's design criteria. Individual project proposals should attempt to conform to all relevant Design Guidelines. Adherence to the Design Guidelines will be an important criterion used to guide City and community review and approval of individual projects within the Plan area.			
Page 73: Site Design - Orient building elements, such as main entries, lobbies, windows and balconies to face streets, public parks, plazas and open spaces to help ensure a consistently high volume of pedestrians, strengthen the visual and physical connection to the street, and reinforce the community character of Japantown. Enhanced visual connections between the building and the open space will help maintain an active, safe and vibrant public open space.	See Apply Japantown-Specific Guidelines on Page 8 of this summary.		

Draft Recommendations	Amendments/Changes	Relevant Information	Issues/Variables
Site Design - CONTINUED - Design hotel, office and residential lobbies to be accessed directly from the street and not from porte cocheres. Porte cocheres are inappropriate for an urban and pedestrian-oriented district; they detract from the visual quality of the sidewalk and diminish pedestrian safety by increasing the number of conflicts between pedestrians and vehicles accessing the building. Therefore, the City and property owners need to find drop-off and delivery options that rely on better managing curb space. - Integrate universal access for all people within the building's overall design concept. - Place utility vaults and access panels in driveway curb cuts so as to prevent blank building frontages and to ensure that sidewalk planting opportunities for street	See Apply Japantown-Specific Guidelines on Page 8 of this summary.	Kabuki Hotel Porte Cochere provides a landscaped open space. A well-designed porte cochere, subject to conditional use permit, may enhance the pedestrian experience.	Restriction on new curb cuts to be vetted with merchant delivery needs

Draft Recommendations	Amendments/Changes	Relevant Information	Issues/Variables
trees and landscaping are not limited. Where necessary, frontages used for utilities, storage, refuse collection and other activities should be integrated into the overall articulation and fenestration of the facade, or be masked by landscaping or other design features where active uses are not possible. - Prohibit new curb cuts on Post Street between Fillmore and Laguna streets and on Fillmore Street (with the exception of the possible relocation of the Japan Center Garage entrance). All loading and deliveries for businesses along Post Street must be made from existing alleyways and driveways, or at the rear of buildings.			
Page 74: Massing and Articulation - Provide strong, repeating vertical articulation on new buildings, especially those with large street frontages, to achieve the	See Apply Japantown-Specific Guidelines on Page 8 of this summary.	Building articulation should also include variation of the building plane (negative space) to avoid monotony. Massing and articulation should also have meaning and relevance to Japantown, Japanese and/or Japanese American history and culture, either explicitly or symbolically. Generic, formulaic, building development should be discouraged.	

Draft Recommendations	Amendments/Changes	Relevant Information	Issues/Variables
visual interest necessary to sustain pedestrian interest and activity. Avoid undifferentiated massing (blank surfaces) longer than 25 feet on residential streets or alleys, and 40 feet on all other streets. Vertical articulation cannot be satisfactorily achieved by minor changes, such as a change in color.			
<u>Massing and Articulation</u> – CONTINUED - Make the size and bulk of new buildings consistent with their architectural style. Historic styles for example, such as board and batten construction, should only be used on buildings of small scale. - Develop rooflines, including roof function, shape, surface materials and colors that are integrated with the building's overall design concept. - Locate and screen rooftop mechanical equipment, penthouses, and other components to	See Apply Japantown-Specific Guidelines on Page 8 of this summary.		

Draft Recommendations	Amendments/Changes	Relevant Information	Issues/Variables
enhance the views of Japantown from surrounding hillsid			
Page 75: Facade Treatment - Use an integrated, consistent range of materials, colors and design elements for each building, including, but not limited to, construction materials, roofs, entrances, and window, door, sign and lighting systems. - Provide variety along a block through design of building frontages, but remain consistent with the overall urban design concept for the area by not mixing radically different materials, construction methods, bulk, massing and articulation. - Use high-quality materials that promote permanence and express skilled craftsmanship, including wood, masonry, ceramic tile, pre-cast concrete and integrated, hard-coat stucco on all visible facades	See Apply Japantown-Specific Guidelines on Page 8 of this summary.		

Draft Recommendations	Amendments/Changes	Relevant Information	Issues/Variables
Avoid using inauthentic materials, in particular those that have the appearance of a thin veneer or attachment, such as EIFs or tilt-up panels. On buildings with frontages greater than 25 linear feet, the use of stucco is limited to less than 25% of the facade and is prohibited on any detailing for a building of any dimension			
Facade Treatment – CONTINUED - Include three-dimensional detailing in building design, such as bay windows, cornices, belt courses, window moldings, and reveals to create shadows and add interest (see image, right). A minimum window reveal of two inches is required above the ground floor and sliding windows or applied mullions on windows visible from the street are not permitted. - Highlight building corners through the choice of design elements including, but	See Apply Japantown-Specific Guidelines on Page 8 of this summary		

Draft Recommendations	Amendments/Changes	Relevant Information	Issues/Variables
not limited to towers, copulas, changes in façade plane, large windows, awnings, canopies, marquees, signs and pedestrian entrances (see image, below right). Integrate new signs and their associated components with the building's overall design concept; they should not overwhelm the building's facade with either color or size. New signs must meet the signage requirements outlined in Article 6 of the Planning Code. Integrate changes in projections, recesses and elevation, along with materials and color to emphasize pedestrian entries and architectural features, and to de-emphasize garage doors and parking. - Integrate exterior light fixtures, including custom light fixtures consistent with the overall design concept, into the building's overall design and should enhance the light levels of the public open space.			

Draft Recommendations	Amendments/Changes	Relevant Information	Issues/Variables
- Recognize important historic buildings in the neighborhood that provide continuity with the past and preserve notable landmarks and areas of historic, architectural or aesthetic value. - Ensure that new development epitomizes the best in contemporary architecture with full awareness of, and respect for, the height, mass, articulation and materials of the best of the older buildings that surrounds them.			
<u>Page 76:</u> <u>Ground Floor Design</u> - Ensure the ground-floor design strengthens the connection between the building and the sidewalk and provide ample visual interest to passing pedestrians. - Differentiate the sidewalk-level of the building from the middle and top by using elements including, but not limited to, different	See Apply Japantown-Specific Guidelines on Page 8 of this summary		

Draft Recommendations	Amendments/Changes	Relevant Information	Issues/Variables
exterior materials, awnings, signs, cornices, projections, setbacks and large windows. A minimum six-inch projection between the ground and second floor is strongly suggested. - Where sidewalks are too narrow to accommodate open space opportunities and there is no potential for narrowing the vehicular right-of-way to better accommodate pedestrians, integrate building setbacks with adjacent sidewalks to increase the space for potential public use, including, but not limited to café seating, stopping spaces and other flexible seating. - Design ground-floor commercial facades to be 75 percent transparent to allow a clear view inwards to an active space from the street; they should not be tinted. Post-construction alterations, such as retail displays, should not prevent a clear view.			

Draft Recommendations	Amendments/Changes	Relevant Information	Issues/Variables
- Enhance residential streets' character and level of pedestrian interest by designing ground-floor units that have direct access at grade level, and not through common corridors or lobbies. Upper story units should connect to a lobby entry that opens directly onto the public way. Where possible, units should not be accessed only from an interior courtyard. The individual entrances to ground-floor units should be set back 3-5 feet but no more than 10 feet from the street-fronting property line, and should be at least 18 inches, and ideally 3 feet, above sidewalk level in order to maintain the unit's privacy (see photo and sketch, top left). - Locate retail entrances at corners. Primary residential entrances should be located away from the corner to prevent congestion.			
Page 77:	See Apply Japantown-Specific Guidelines on Page 8 of this		

Draft Recommendations	Amendments/Changes	Relevant Information	Issues/Variables
Parking and Access - Discourage at- or above-grade parking. Where ator above-grade parking is necessary, it must be wrapped with a minimum of 25 feet of active use at the ground floor and 15 feet above the ground floor (see drawing, above right). Allowable uses include the primary and secondary street frontages, except for the minimum frontage required for fire doors and parking access. - Minimize the negative effect of parking entrances on pedestrians by limiting the number and width of openings and architecturally integrating them into the building or landscaping. Residential garage door widths should be limited to eight feet; for residential door for ingress and egress is allowed, but each door must not exceed eight feet and should be separated by at least one foot.	summary		

Draft Recommendations	Amendments/Changes	Relevant Information	Issues/Variables
- Minimize the number of entrances and exits in parking structures. For garages with 100 or fewer spaces, a single opening no more than 20 feet wide is allowed. For garages with more than 100 spaces, no more than two openings 20 feet wide are allowed. Where a building has two frontages, locate parking entrances, loading docks, bays, and auxiliary entrances on secondary streets (pictured right), and their visual impact on the neighborhood should be minimized. - Prohibit off-street parking entrances on Post Street, except			
Page 78: Private Open Space – Develop rooftop terraces, gardens, and associated landscaped areas to be both attractive common open space and effective storm water management tools.	See Apply Japantown-Specific Guidelines on Page 8 of this summary		
Private Open Space –	See Apply Japantown-Specific		

Draft Recommendations	Amendments/Changes	Relevant Information	Issues/Variables
CONTINUED -_Incorporate seating opportunities in new development. The design of planters and low walls can provide safe, comfortable places where people can stop, view, socialize and rest. Integrating large windows adjacent to plazas and gathering spaces (i.e. stopping and viewing places) improves the site's attractiveness to visitors and provides more opportunity for community interaction (see image, right). Sidewalk and outdoor dining spaces are encouraged; these spaces should not conflict with other sidewalk uses (see images opposite page) - Develop integrated weather protection systems at the sidewalk-level of buildings, especially at or near building entry points, to mitigate the effects of rain, wind, glare, shadow, reflection, and sunlight on the	Guidelines on Page 8 of this summary		

Draft Recommendations	Amendments/Changes	Relevant Information	Issues/Variables
pedestrian environment.			

Chapter 6 - Public Realm – all discussion points (purple type = Rose 7/1/11; green type = more from Rose on 8/10/11)

To better align and support one of the goals of the Japantown Plan, it is recommended to enhance the Japanese character of both the core area and the Special Use District while keeping safety, cleanliness and ease of maintenance in mind. The Public Realm recommendations also intertwine with the Built Form recommendations in some areas as well as Transportation and Cultural/Heritage recommendations. The Public Realm areas include the streets, sidewalks, parks, plazas and other publicly available space as well as signage, banners and art.

Overall, the recommendation for Japantown Peace Plaza and Buchanan Mall is to make them more user-friendly, landscaped with plantings characteristic of Japanese gardens and incorporate Japanese style lighting and signage. In addition, several important points listed below are recommended to make the streets surrounding Japantown more pedestrian-friendly with Japanese design for lighting, signs and banner to reflect this culture to create a special sense of place both physically and emotionally and to retain authentic Japanese heritage character.

Japantown's Public Realm was redone as part of an urban-renewal project and has lost its quaint neighborhood charm that once existed before World War II. Few places such as Japantown's Peace Plaza exist where Japanese culturally-related events still are performed in the streets and on the special Peace Plaza space. The iconic Peace Pagoda as a gift from San Francisco's Sister City, Osaka, stands as a photogenic symbol of the Japantown area, unobstructed in its location from several vantage points.

Comment [11]: Add more historic info, importance of culturally sensitive materials and designs used in Japantown. Needs more work here…

01. The creation of a children's playground is recommended at alternative sites.
02. The Webster Street Linear Park is deleted.
03. Use of sustainable materials and methods while keeping the charm and authenticity of the Public Realm areas in tact is recommended.
04. Identify and enhance all open space opportunities
05. Explicitly call for landscaping that reflects Japanese horticulture and landscape design done by a professional with expertise in the area; otherwise, the landscape deemphasizes the clear importance of Japantown, its history and culture of the people who once had a thriving community here. Refer to Open Space Pictorial Album used at Community Town Hall meeting as well as Appendix for Japanese landscaping plants for consideration. Appendix of pictures to be put in "Open Space Pictorial Album." Pics were used at Open Realm community meeting – album still needs to be made into a pdf as of August 10, 2011.
06. Incorporate standardized signage with designs that signal to the visitors that they have entered Japantown
07. Improve Connections between north and south sides of Geary, creating a more pedestrian-friendly path across Geary
08. Have Geary BRT utilize signs to direct visitors to Japantown
09. Install Japanese-style lighting along streets and along streets that make up the core and SUD of Japantown.
10. Incorporate a public art program that is reflective of Japanese culture and/or history
11. Mark Japantown's Entrances with Torii (gates).

(See Ken Kaji Webster Street Linear Park memo May 28, 2010, and Public Realm Goal Review May 18, 2010

Recommendations that should be retained:
6.2 retain general strategy comments on pg 88 and 90.
Retain bullet point on pg 94 – conduct shadow and wind analysis to ensure desirable and appropriate design (add and impact to any significant public realm design)

Draft Recommendations	Amendments/Changes	Relevant Information	Issues/Variables
Overall	Recreation and Open Space of the San Francisco General Plan	How has it changed	Impact to this section
Overall	Draft – Better Streets Plan Need to see how this jibes w/ recommendations for streets around Jtown	Is it the Green Landscaping ordinance?	
Executive Summary	Create new paragraph with vision forefront, then go into the history as to why it is the way it is today in chapter		Start off with a positive vision, See purple and green narrative above.
Overall chapter	Remove Webster street park comments	All related Photos, maps on several pages	
Insert an appendix that can be addressed in 6.2	Appendix is a detailed listing of botanical specimens that are relevant to Japanese Culture	Keep photo on pg 94 and add more photo examples in the Appendix and refer to Open Space Pictorial Album.	Creation of "Open Space Pictorial Album" into a pdf still pending.
ADD	Consider implementing public arts program and periodically evaluate art that can be considered appropriately labeled for culturally relevant purposes		
ADD reference to eternal flame	Re-design Peace Plaze and ~~Enhance~~ relocate eternal flame to a more prominent location	Encased in broken glass housing, hidden and in disrepair	
Revise	Create more gather areas that target age specific groups	Children play areas, young adults	From Community Meetings, children's play areas need to be very close to Jtown central vs. Hamilton, etc. in surrounding areas.
Way finding signage	Pg 85, 100, 101		Are these photos example of what the community wants to see? Wayfinding signs sh/b in English/Japanese or pictorial so people can easily identify via

Comment [13]: Elimination of WSLP

Comment [12]: I believe this is ROSE

Comment [14]: No, it is not.

Comment [15]:

Comment [16]: Don't see any sign on Page 85 in JBNP document. Better to put signage examples in the Appendix and have more pics of signs from within SF and in nearby Jtowns or other cultural areas such as Chinatown.

Draft Recommendations	Amendments/Changes	Relevant Information	Issues/Variables
			symbols/patterns.
ADD	Ensure that Japantown is appropriately referenced in city/local brochures/maps, by ensuring community is well informed and connected by an appropriate representative of Japantown.		
ADD	Reference to professional overall public realm and well orchestrated design that is in development		

Chapter 7 – Transportation

(See complete chapter edits attached.)

Draft Recommendations	Amendments / Changes	Relevant Information	Issues / Variables
Existing Conditions			
p. 104, Existing Pedestrian Conditions	Add discussion identifying the problems pedestrians face crossing Geary to/from Japantown as a contributing factor to the divisive nature of Geary.	Repeated discussions in community meetings of Geary as a N/S divide segregating Japantown from St. Francis Square and communities S of Geary.	
p. 110, Roadway Network	Add discussion identifying the lack of left turn opportunities from E-bound Geary	No L turn from E-bound Geary from Fillmore to Franklin. This is a barrier to entry from the Richmond/Sunset, where Geary is the main through road.	
Recommendations			
Improve Circulation for All Modes			
Prioritize Pedestrian Safety and Accessibility at Key Intersections (p. 116)	This section fails to deal adequately with the issue of Geary. Needs revision; no clear recommendations can be made without BRT participation.	Width, traffic speeds, traffic intensity are all major problems that inhibit pedestrian crossings N/S across Geary	BRT designs for Gough to Steiner stretch.

Draft Recommendations	Amendments / Changes	Relevant Information	Issues / Variables
	Needs clearer linkage to BRT team.		
	Recommendation to remove pedestrian bridges across Geary and replace with grade-level crossings.	Multiple public comment instances about inadequacy of pedestrian bridges: unsuitable for seniors, families with infants; safety concerns.	
	'Slow Zone" strategies on Geary, Webster		Signage Geary Expressway concept a major problem: Excessive speed and intensity
Remove Two Travel Lanes on Webster Street (p116)	Delete this recommendation – Keep as is at least N to Sutter.	Issues with linear park; traffic back-ups at Post and Webster are related to turning traffic/pedestrian conflicts. Sutter and Webster has similar, but less severe, conflicts with turning	The linear park, which justified this recommendation, does not appear viable: Many driveway crossings; capital and operating costs ; utility given slopes, wind, all unresolved.
	Improve Median plantings and art instead of Linear park; consider greening sidewalks N of Post		At current width between Geary and Bush, the median is an essential part of pedestrian crossing.
Re-Envision Post and Sutter Streets (p.119)	Delete back-in angled parking (p. 119)		
	Evaluate a center lane loading zone on Post, rather than additional yellow zones. (p. 119)	Curb yellow zones that require parallel parking by delivery vehicles do not deliver expected benefits.	
	Do not implement dedicated bus/bike lanes.(p 119, 120)	No evidence that traffic intensity justifies dedicated bus lanes	
	Do not implement center turn lanes on Post or Sutter (p.119, 120)	No evidence that traffic intensity justifies them	
Increase Education and Enforcement Programs (p.119)	Slow zone strategies needed within Japantown boundaries, especially for Geary Expressway segment		Needs integration with Geary BRT strategies
Improve Transit Access			

Draft Recommendations	Amendments / Changes	Relevant Information	Issues / Variables
and Efficiency			
Coordinate with the Transit Effectiveness Project (p. 121)	Revise to reflect TEP decisions and establish a formal coordination process with SFMTA agreement to engage.	Buses do are not friendly to strollers, luggage, or parcels – a disincentive to use transit as part of a family outing. Wheelchair/walker access present but clumsy compared to e.g. London transit system.	SFMTA & TEP focused on improving transit to support commute demands - but it is not evident that this meets the needs of families, shoppers, or travelers with luggage. Since Japantown is a regional destination for families, and offers Japanese groceries as well as household items, the TEP program has failed to adequately address these needs.
		Connections (and directions) to Japantown from regional transit (BART, Golden Gate Transit, ferries) are not evident to transit users.	
		While E/W transit is good, N/S connections within San Francisco are weak.	Observation that connections to the Richmond are good, but connections from the Sunset reuire a connection with a N/S line and transit time is excessive.
		The transit recommendations do not address signage (e.g. "Welcome to Japantown") on and off the bus; they also do not address stop locations (e.g. should the 38 stop at the base of the Peace Plaza?)	Additional transit stop issues are lighting and safety concerns.
Consider Re-routing the 1BX-California Express			
Coordinate with Geary Corridor Bus Rapid Transit (BRT) Project (p.121)	Complete BRT section needs updating to reflect BRT decisions since 2009 that narrow options in the Japantown area.		Appropriate liaison with BRT on stop locations, signage, design, …
Improve Parking Management	Need to distinguish between resident needs and parking to support Japantown's role as a regional		

Draft Recommendations	Amendments / Changes	Relevant Information	Issues / Variables
	destination.		
Coordinate with SFpark Programs in Japantown			What has been learned from SFpark pilot programs?
Price On-street Parking Meter Rates to Meet Demand			
Determine Feasibility of a Parking Benefit District to Capture Increased Meter Revenue			
Provide Additional Parking Regulation			
Provide Additional Bicycle Parking			
Encourage and Maximize Mixed-use Development to Incorporate Structured Parking with New Commercial and Housing Development			New developments should focus on below-ground parking
Consider the Opportunity to Increase the City's Revenue by Providing New Structured Parking under Geary Boulevard (p.127)	Delete – BRT has rejected this	While there is strong interest in the community, the BRT team has rejected this option.	
Set New Requirements for New Residential Development	p. 127 – 1:1 parking permitted for all residential development.	Capping parking at 0.75 per residential unit is a concern. Decoupling parking from units, and letting the developer decide, is preferred strategy.	Concern that residential demand would take parking needed by visitors to the local businesses.
Provide CarShare and Secure Bicycle Parking in Off-Street Parking Areas	Add recommendation for Electric charging stations as part of Japantown parking strategies.	General support for these recommendations	
Enhance Personal Safety and Wayfinding			

Draft Recommendations	Amendments / Changes	Relevant Information	Issues / Variables

Chapter 8 – Japan Center

(See complete chapter edits attached.)

Recommendations that should be retained:

1. Mitigate Impact of Japan Center Construction
2. Explore Strategies for Temporarily Relocating Businesses During Renovation
3. Ensure Japanese-oriented Retail is the Centerpiece of Any New Development of Japan Center
4. The City Should Participate Actively in the Planning and Development of Any New Development Project on Japan Center.
5. Integrate and Enhance Peace Plaza as a Central Community Gathering Place in Any Redesign.
6. Integrate Japanese-influenced Design Aesthetic in the Center's Redesign.

Draft Recommendations	Amendments / Changes	Relevant Information	Issues / Variables
	General Comment: The Japan Center will be included in the study done by Burlington Associates as to the formation of a commercial community land trust. The study will examine constructive ways to improve the malls without closure of the garage or other significant disruption to mall tenants and neighboring businesses.		Discussion point: Assessment of property owners and tenants; Pioneering in USA; Related to CLT.
Page131	Add: A greater number of people in the community were pleased that demolition of Japan Center was put on hold.		

Draft Recommendations	Amendments / Changes	Relevant Information	Issues / Variables
Page 132 Include affordable housing….	Add: Safeway parking lot and west of Fillmore and Geary as additional opportunity sites.		
Page 133 The Japan Center Garage	Add: A study needs to be done to determine how much development can be done without a full tear down and closure of the garage. A previous study determined that an additional two stories could be built on the Miyako Mall without changing the garage foundation.		
Page 134 Phasing of Construction…	Amend as follows: Phasing of construction will allow existing businesses in the Japan Center to remain open during construction. Phasing of construction will increase the cost of development, but it might be the only way to retain businesses and provide parking for the other businesses in Jtown. It will increase the amount of time of major construction.	For any renovation of malls, a phased construction approach needs to be investigated.	Discussion Point: Construction mitigation requirements.
Page 134 Development Economics	Add: The feasibility study did not consider minor renovation with would not require demolition of the malls and garage.	Burlington Associates, Seifel-led consultants will make recommendations.	
Page 135 8.2 Recommendations and Strategies TO ALL RECOMMENDATIONS: (from Chap 9) RESPONSIBLE ENTITIES	Add to end of introduction. The above will be studied as part of the community land trust.	Burlington Associates, Seifel-led consultants will make recommendation.	

Draft Recommendations	Amendments / Changes	Relevant Information	Issues / Variables
POTENTIAL FUNDING SOURCES			
Page 136 Allow for Residential Development of Sufficient Height….	Delete all except: Will study addition of two levels of housing over the Miyako Mall without closing the garage.		Discussion Point: 1. Affordable Housing 2. Appropriate community benefits.
Page 139 Ensure New Development (of the malls) opens up to the neighborhood	Delete 'Most' and insert 'Some'		
Page 141 Work with Developer to Encourage Provision of Affordable Housing….	Add: This is more relevant to major new construction that will impact the neighborhood. Community benefits (impact fees) need to be better understood, particularly, what can be included among community needs, i.e. nexus studies)		Discussion Point: Need education/update on inclusionary housing.
Page 141 Work with All Parties to Create a Fair and Balanced Public Benefit Package	Delete.		
	Add from Chapter 5 pages 42-43 - Mitigate the Impact of Future Japan Center Construction - Explore Strategies for - Temporarily Relocating Japan Center Businesses During Renovation. - Retain the Japan Center Character and its Roles as a Community Gathering Place, Showcase for Japanese American Culture, and Home for Culturally Appropriate Businesses		