

SAN FRANCISCO HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

Meeting Minutes

Commission Chambers, Room 400
City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place
San Francisco, CA 94102-4689

Wednesday, October 16, 2013
12:30 p.m.
Regular Meeting

COMMISSIONERS PRESENT: Hasz, Wolfram, Hyland, Johnck, Matsuda , Pearlman
COMMISSIONER ABSENT: Johns

THE MEETING WAS CALLED TO ORDER BY PRESIDENT HASZ AT 12:32 P.M.

STAFF IN ATTENDANCE: John Rahaim – Planning Director, Lisa Gibson, Shelley Caltagirone, Susan Parks, Jonathan Lammers, Preservation Coordinator Tim Frye, and Jonas P. Ionin – Acting Commission Secretary.

SPEAKER KEY:

- + indicates a speaker in support of an item;
- indicates a speaker in opposition to an item; and
- = indicates a neutral speaker or a speaker who did not indicate support or opposition.

A. PUBLIC COMMENT

SPEAKERS: NONE

B. DEPARTMENT MATTERS

1. [Director's Announcements](#)

Preservation Coordinator Frye on behalf of Director Rahaim would answer questions regarding the Director's Report.

2. Mr. Frye's stated there was no report related to historic preservation at the Planning Commission the last couple of weeks, but announced of the following:

- The African-American History Project community meeting was held on October 10th and 50 people participated in an overview of the project presented by the consultant. The meeting was intended to identify members of the community who might be interested in participating in the Department's stake-holder group. Many participants were concerned about work related to staffing, level of community involvement and participation. The Department would work with the public and re-strategize the approach with the community.
- The landmark designation completed earlier this year for Twin Peaks Tavern would receive an award from the National Trust in Indianapolis and from Governor Jerry Brown. He thanked SF Heritage for selecting it for consideration.
- Introduction of Eiliesh Tuffy as the new Preservation Technical Specialist who joined the Southwest Planning Team was introduced with a description of her educational and professional experience.

Commissioner Johnck went to the African-American History Project meeting and commented that there was overall good support of the project and that there was also a group that challenged the work. She recommended in going forward to look at SPUR's Historic Preservation Report as a guide and to insure the community that the Department is as inclusive as possible. She believed the Department would also come up with good recommendations to address some of the issues that were brought up.

Commission Matsuda 1) suggested that the Department might want to connect with the initial members of the JCHES community group because some of the same issues occurred around inclusion and who's going to tell the story; and 2) asked if there is not an endangered reserve list for City and County of San Francisco, maybe that is something to consider. **Mr. Frye** responded that there is no such list.

3. [Landmark Designation Work Program Quarterly Report](#)

Mr. Frye on the Quarterly Report pointed out that Marcus Books would be before the HPC on November 6th for consideration to recommend landmark designation to the Board of Supervisors. Landmark designation for Newall Hall which is nearing completion would probably be next. The rest of the landmark designations are moving along. Many of the Article 10 and 11 owner initiated nominations for landmark designations are in the pipeline. The few that HPC would hear in the next few months include Old St. Mary's Church Rectory, The Henry Adams Building, 149 9th Street, Great Cloud of Witnesses and the Strand Theater.

SPEAKERS: NONE

Mr. Frye responded to **Commission Hyland's** question that the three items added to the JCHES Plan would appear in the next Quarterly Report.

President Hasz would follow-up with Ms. Mealy on the timeline for the Sunshine School.

C. COMMISSION MATTERS

4. President's Report and Announcements

President Hasz met with Marcus Books building owners. The HPC would be hearing it on November 6.

5. Consideration of Adoption:

- Draft Minutes for October 2, 2013

SPEAKERS: None

ACTION: Adopted as corrected for Item #6 - 340-350 Fremont Street

AYES: Hyland, Johnck, Matsuda, Pearlman, Wolfram, Hasz

ABSENT: Johns

6. Commission Comments & Questions

- Disclosures

President Hasz met with Pine Street project sponsor.

Commissioner Pearlman met with Pine Street project sponsor

- Inquiries/Announcements.

Commissioner Pearlman brought to the attention of the HPC and the public that Hibernia Bank Building was brazenly graffitied by an artist who videoed himself at the time of the incident while 10 to 15 bystanders who watched and took pictures instead of calling the police.

- Future Meetings/Agendas -None

D. REGULAR CALENDAR

7. [2011.1306E](#) (LISA GIBSON: 415/575-9032)
1634-1690 PINE STREET PROJECT – North side of Pine Street between Franklin Street and Van Ness Avenue, Lots 007, 008, 009, 010, and 010A, Assessor's Block 0647 – **Commission Review and Comment on the Draft Environmental Impact Report (DEIR)**. The project site is occupied by five vacant one- to two-story buildings that comprise the entire Pine Street Auto Shops Historic District and a parking lot. The proposed project would merge the six lots into one parcel, demolish most of the existing five buildings, and construct a 130-foot-tall 353,360-gross-square-foot building containing 262 residential units in two 13-story

towers, 5,600 square feet of commercial use on the ground and second floors, and one level of below-grade parking for 245 vehicles and 91 bicycles. Three of the existing building façades would be restored and incorporated into the proposed project. The project site is within the NC-3 (Moderate-Scale Neighborhood Commercial) Zoning District, the Van Ness Automotive Special Use District, and a 130-E Height and Bulk District. The DEIR finds that implementation of the proposed project would lead to significant and unavoidable project-level and cumulative impacts on historic architectural resources.

The Historic Preservation Commission will discuss the DEIR to frame written comments on the adequacy of the DEIR, pursuant to the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA).

SPEAKERS: Mike Buhler, SF Heritage – proposed project is not a meaningful proposal, full versus partial preservation alternatives
 ACTION: Directed staff to draft HPC comments
 AYES: Hyland, Johnck, Matsuda, Pearlman, Wolfram, Hasz
 ABSENT: Johns
 COMMENT LETTER: L-0024

8. (TIM FRYE 415/575-6822)
[SPUR/SAN FRANCISCO HERITAGE HISTORIC PRESERVATION REPORT](#) – Members of the SPUR/Heritage Historic Preservation Task Force will give an **Informational Presentation** of its report on the City’s Historic Preservation Program and recommendations to improve related City processes.
Preliminary Recommendation: None - Informational Only

PRESENTERS: Sarah Karlinsky, Deputy Director of SPUR; Mike Buhler, SF Architectural Heritage; Andrew Junius, Reuben, Junius & Rose LLP.
 SPEAKERS: None
 ACTION: None - Informational only

9. [2013.0693A](#) (SHELLEY CALTAGIRONE: 415/558-6625)
[940 GROVE STREET](#), north side between Steiner and Fillmore Streets. Assessor’s Block 0798, Lot 010. **Request for Certificate of Appropriateness** to (1) modify the configuration and location of a new garage approved under HPC Motion No. 0147; (2) modify the location of window and door openings at the north and east facades previously approved; (3) replace windows at all facades with wood-framed, dual-glazed windows to match the historic configurations; (4) replace the historic wood siding at the north façade with a simplified board and trim pattern; (5) reinstall a window at the west gable end at the attic level to match the previous condition; and, (6) raise the height of the railing at the eastern roof deck previously approved to 42”. Please note that many of the proposed changes have already been completed and that the applicant is requesting that the Commission legalize the work performed without the benefit of a permit. The subject property is a contributing building within the Alamo Square Historic District. The property is zoned RH-3 (Residential, House, Three-Family) and is in a 40-X Height and Bulk District.
Preliminary Recommendation: Approve with Conditions

PRESENTER: Lu Blazej, Representing Project Sponsor and Owner Pat Hansen and Quincy Smith

SPEAKERS:

- Erma Cobb, Neighbor - concerned and want to know if there's consistent ruling about work being done beyond what was approved and without a permit;
- + Ted Bartlett, former Owner of 940 Grove - supported the work that was completed and believed the owners be given an award or tax credit for completing the work in a short time;
- + Sheri Matson, Neighbor - supported the project to be finished and asked the HPC to consider the burden on property owners;
- + Joe Donahue, Neighbor - praised that the work done so far has already transformed the neighborhood and suggested only the 10-ft exposed view of the blind wall be brought back to its original historic fabric.

ACTION: After hearing and closing public comment, continued to November 20, 2013

AYES: Hyland, Johnck, Matsuda, Pearlman, Wolfram, Hasz

ABSENT: Johns

10. 2012.1197A (TIM FRYE FOR KELLY WONG: 415/575-9100)
302 GREENWICH STREET / 1531 MONTGOMERY STREET, north side of Greenwich Street and at the end of Montgomery Street. Assessor's Block 0079, Lots 004 & 005. **Request for Certificate of Appropriateness** to (1) restore original roofline at south elevation of main building; (2) replace non-historic windows and doors at detached building; (3) remove existing non-historic concrete wall and wrought gate and install a redwood fence and gate; (4) replace non-historic wood doors throughout the property; (5) repair the third floor roof deck; (6) restore the exterior brick stairway including repairing the awning; and, (7) general exterior restoration including repairs to the wood shingles, crenellated wood parapet and moldings, and painting. Please note that items 1-4 were included in a previously approved Certificate of Appropriateness (Case No. 2007.06553A) which addressed work cited within a Notice of Violation for work executed without benefit of permit. The subject property is City Landmark No. 121, Julius' Castle. The property is zoned RH-3 (Residential, House, Three-Family) and is in a 40-X Height and Bulk District.
Preliminary Recommendation: Approve with Conditions

PRESENTER: Paul Scott, President of Save Our Waterfront, Lawyer, and Project Sponsor; Mark Holberg, Preservation Architect

SPEAKERS:

- Peter Anderson, Resident near-by - had concerns about rodent infestation problem, structural integrity and restoring the project back to restaurant use;
- + Mark Miller, Architect - supported the project;
- + Joe Lucier, Native San Franciscan and Real Estate Broker - commented that Mr. Scott bought the landmark building in the pricey Montgomery block and with a passion wants restore it;

+ Paul Buckner, the original professional Color Consultant for the Julius Castle - recommended using the original color scheme and also brought HPC's attention to Mr. Scott's three color schemes on a board.

ACTION: Approved with conditions as amended to strike Bullet Points 3, 4, 5, 6, and 7; add at following HPC in the last sentence in Bullet Point 2; modify Bullet Point 8 to include material board prior to architectural addendum; and add mock-up paint scheme to Bullet Point 9.

AYES: Hyland, Johnck, Matsuda, Pearlman, Wolfram, Hasz

ABSENT: Johns

MOTION: M-0213

11a. [2013.0576U](#) (SUSAN PARKS: 415/575-9101)
1019 MARKET STREET, east side of Market Street between 6th and 7th Streets. Assessor's Block 3703, Lot 076. **Consideration of adoption of a resolution** recommending Board of Supervisors approval of a Mills Act historical property contract. The Mills Act authorizes local governments to enter into contracts with owners of private historical property who, through the historical property contract, assure the rehabilitation, restoration, preservation and maintenance of a qualified historical property. In return, the property owner enjoys a reduction in property taxes for a given period. Designated as a Category II (Significant) building under Article 11 of the Planning Code, and listed on the National Register of Historic Places as a contributor to the Market Street Theater Loft District, the seven-story building was constructed in 1909 by the McDonough Estate Company, and designed by architect George Applegarth, to house the Eastern Outfitting Company. The subject property is within in a C-3-G (Downtown General) Zoning District and 120-X Height and Bulk District.

Preliminary Recommendation: Approve

SPEAKERS: + Colby Dernan;
 + Greg Buchanan.

ACTION: Adopted the resolution for recommendation to the Board of Supervisors for approval of the Mills Act Contract

AYES: Hyland, Johnck, Matsuda, Pearlman, Wolfram, Hasz

ABSENT: Johns

RESOLUTION: R-714

11b. [2012.0679U](#) (SUSAN PARKS: 415/575-9101)
2250 WEBSTER STREET, east side of Market Street between Broadway and Pacific Streets. Assessor's Block 0580, Lot 013. **Consideration of adoption of a resolution** recommending Board of Supervisors approval of a Mills Act historical property contract. The Mills Act authorizes local governments to enter into contracts with owners of private historical property who, through the historical property contract, assure the rehabilitation, restoration, preservation and maintenance of a qualified historical property. In return, the property owner enjoys a reduction in property taxes for a given period. Designated City Landmark No.38 under Article 10 of the Planning Code, the three-story-over-basement, masonry residence was built in 1896 by William Bourne, President of the Spring Valley Water Company and designed by architect Willis Polk in the classical Revival style. It is

located in a RH-2 (Residential- House, Two Family) Zoning District and 40-X Height and Bulk District.

Preliminary Recommendation: Approve

- SPEAKERS: + Colby Dernan;
+ Greg Buchanan.
- ACTION: Adopted the resolution for recommendation to the Board of Supervisors for approval of the Mills Act Contract
- AYES: Hyland, Johnck, Matsuda, Pearlman, Wolfram, Hasz
- ABSENT: Johns
- RESOLUTION: R-715

11c. [2013.0582U](#) (SUSAN PARKS: 415/575-9101)
3769 20TH STREET, south side of 20th Street between Dolores and Guerrero Streets. Assessor's Block 3607, Lot 062. **Consideration of adoption of a resolution** recommending Board of Supervisors approval of a Mills Act historical property contract. The Mills Act authorizes local governments to enter into contracts with owners of private historical property who, through the historical property contract, assure the rehabilitation, restoration, preservation and maintenance of a qualified historical property. In return, the property owner enjoys a reduction in property taxes for a given period. Designated as a contributor to the Liberty-Hill Landmark District under Article 10 of the Planning Code, the two-story-over-basement, frame residence was built in 1871 in the Italianate style. It is located in a RH-2 (Residential-House, Two Family) Zoning District and 40-X Height and Bulk District.

Preliminary Recommendation: Approve

- SPEAKERS: + Colby Dernan;
+ Greg Buchanan.
- ACTION: Adopted the resolution for recommendation to the Board of Supervisors for approval of the Mills Act Contract
- AYES: Hyland, Johnck, Matsuda, Pearlman, Wolfram, Hasz
- ABSENT: Johns
- RESOLUTION: R-716

12. [2013.1426U](#) (JONATHAN LAMMERS: 415/575-9093)
1 KEARNY STREET, west side between Market and Geary streets, in Assessor's Block 0312, Lot 031. **Request for Review and Comment** on the nomination of the property to the National Register of Historic Places. Historically known as the Mutual Savings Bank, the subject property is a Category I (Significant) building located within the Kearny-Market-Mason-Sutter Conservation District; C-3-O (Downtown Office) and C-2-R (Downtown Retail) Districts; and 150-X and 80-130-F Height and Bulk Districts.

Preliminary Recommendation: Send resolution of findings in support of the nomination, subject to revisions, to California OHP to approve nomination of the subject property to the National Register

- RECUSED: Commissioner Hasz
- AYES: Hyland, Johnck, Matsuda, Pearlman, Wolfram

ABSENT: Johns
SPEAKERS: None
ACTION: Adopted the resolution recommending the nomination to the Office of Historic Preservation.
AYES: Hyland, Johnck, Matsuda, Pearlman, Wolfram
ABSENT: Johns
RESOLUTION: R-717

ADJOURNMENT: **4:30 PM**

DRAFT