

SAN FRANCISCO HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

DRAFT Meeting Minutes

Commission Chambers, Room 400
City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place
San Francisco, CA 94102-4689

Wednesday, December 4, 2013
12:30 p.m.
Regular Meeting

COMMISSIONERS PRESENT: Hasz, Hyland, Johnck, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman, Wolfram

THE MEETING WAS CALLED TO ORDER BY PRESIDENT HASZ AT 12:59 p.m.

STAFF IN ATTENDANCE: John Rahaim – Planning Director, Kelly Wong, Brittany Bendix, Lily Yegazu, Richard Sucre, Susan Parks, Tim Frye - Preservation Coordinator, and Jonas P. Ionin - Commission Secretary.

SPEAKER KEY:

- + indicates a speaker in support of an item;
- indicates a speaker in opposition to an item; and
- = indicates a neutral speaker or a speaker who did not indicate support or opposition.

A. PUBLIC COMMENT

SPEAKERS: NONE

B. DEPARTMENT MATTERS1. [Director's Announcements](#)

Preservation Coordinator Frye on behalf of Planning Director Rahaim would answer questions on the Governor's award given to Twin Peaks Tavern Landmark Designation on the Director's Report included in the packet.

2. Mr. Frye reported on two items:

- Construction work on Filbert Street Cottages re-commenced after the court dissolved the temporary stay of the litigation;
- On 11/21/13, the Planning Commission granted an extension for 1095 Market Street that the HPC approved in 2010 for a Major Permit to Alter on the exterior rehabilitation work. The CPC extended the Conditional Use Authorization, adding two conditions of approval on a site permit application and the first construction permit, to be filed within one and two years, respectively. The building would convert an office to a 94-room hotel and hostel use.

Commissioner Matsuda requested an update on the Sam Wo Building. **Mr. Frye** responded that work might have been done in the interior without the benefit of a permit. The Department of Building Inspection (DBI) had issued a Stop-Work Order and the Planning Department had scheduled a meeting with the DBI. Mr. Frye would keep the HPC posted.

C. COMMISSION MATTERS

3. President's Report and Announcements - None

4. Consideration of Adoption:

- [Draft Minutes for the November 20, 2013 – ARC Meeting](#); and
- [Draft Minutes for the November 20, 2013 – Regular Meeting](#)

SPEAKERS: None

ACTION: Adopted as corrected - for the 11/20/13 ARC meeting minutes, Page 2 - change "Preferred ~~something that~~ painting which would not require maintenance; and "Pulling the janitor door slightly ~~in front~~ behind the ~~door wall~~ plane would make the door appear recessed; and for the 11/20/13 HPC meeting minutes, Page 2, Item 2, change "Work on Silver Filbert Cottages..."

AYES: Hyland, Johnck, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman, Wolfram, Hasz

5. Commission Comments & Questions

- [Disclosures](#) - None

- Inquiries/Announcements

Commissioner Pearlman thought the news he saw on television on an agreement reached between the original and current owners for the re-purchase of Marcus Bookstore Building for \$2.5 Million (money to be raised) was a wonderful resolution to a tense situation.

Commissioner Hasz visited 940 Grove Street with Planner Shelley Caltagirone and assessed that the situation has not gone awry as thought. Sponsor would update the plans and could bring it back to the HPC the first meeting in January.

- Future Meetings/Agendas - None

D. CONSIDERATION OF ITEMS PROPOSED FOR CONTINUANCE

6. 2013.0912A (KELLY WONG: 415/558-6369)
845 MONTGOMERY STREET – west side between Pacific Avenue and Jackson Street. Assessor’s Block 0176, Lots 030-043 - **Request for a Certificate of Appropriateness** for general exterior restoration of the historic building and the re-cladding of rooftop penthouse addition constructed in 2000. The proposal includes the rehabilitation of existing double-hung wood windows, in-kind replacement of floor tiles at deck and concrete pavers at roof, stabilization of existing glass balustrades, and the re-cladding of the rooftop penthouse addition with a new compatible tile. The project also includes general maintenance and repairs not subject to review and approval by the Historic Preservation Commission. 845 Montgomery Street, historically known as the Hotel European, was constructed in 1911 by Architect Albert Pissis and is a Georgian style three-story brick building with contemporary storefronts at the ground floor. The subject building is a Contributory/Compatible building and within the Jackson Square Landmark District under Article 10 of the Planning Code.
(Proposed for Continuance to February 5, 2014)
Preliminary Recommendation: Approve with Conditions

SPEAKERS: None
 ACTION: Continued to February 5, 2014.
 AYES: Hyland, Johnck, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman, Wolfram, Hasz

E. CONSENT CALENDAR

7. [2013.0706A](#) (BRITTANY BENDIX: 415/575-9114)
1021 HAYES STREET - south side between Pierce and Steiner Streets. Assessor’s Block 0823, Lot 015 - **Request for a Certificate of Appropriateness** to insert a two-car garage into the front property line retaining wall and below the existing two-unit dwelling. To accommodate the garage, the project also includes excavation of approximately 840 square-feet at the basement level. The proposed garage opening is 8’ wide by 7.5’ wide and would remove a portion of the rusticated concrete retaining wall. The subject property

is a contributing building within the Alamo Square Landmark District. The property is within a RH-3 (Residential, House, Three-Family) District and 40-X Height and Bulk District.
Preliminary Recommendation: Approve with Conditions

SPEAKERS: None
ACTION: Approved
AYES: Hyland, Johnck, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman, Wolfram, Hasz
MOTION: M-0217

8. [2013.1629H](#) (LILY YEGAZU: 415/575-9076)
1355 MARKET STREET - south side between 9th and 10th Streets. Assessor's Block 3508, Lot 001 – **Request for a Major Permit to Alter** for alterations of existing openings along the west facing façade of the 9th Street Wing between Stevenson and Jesse Streets. Specifically three existing windows and one pair of doors will be removed to create new openings and one back-of-house entry door will be in-filled. The new openings will be similar in style to the openings previously approved for the project site (Case Nos. 2012.0502H & 2013.0523H). The subject property is an Art Deco commercial building constructed in 1936-1937 with addition along 9th Street in 1947. Historically known as the Western Furniture Exchange & Merchandise Mart, the structure is a Category I (Significant) building under Article 11 of the Planning Code and is located in a C-3-G (Downtown General Commercial) Zoning District and 120-X-200-S Height and Bulk District
Preliminary Recommendation: Approve

SPEAKERS: None
ACTION: Approved
AYES: Hyland, Johnck, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman, Wolfram, Hasz
MOTION: M-0218

F. REGULAR CALENDAR

9. [2013.1168E](#) (R. SUCRE: 415/575-9108; M. PAEZ: 415/705-8674)
400-600 20TH STREET, PIER 70 (20TH STREET HISTORIC BUILDINGS), located along 20th Street between Illinois and Louisiana Streets, Assessor's Block 4046, Lot 001; Block 4111, Lots 003 and 004; and, a portion of Block 4052, Lot 001. **Informational Presentation** on the proposed project to rehabilitate and reuse ten buildings (Building Nos. 14, 101, 102, 104, 113, 114, 115, 116, 122 and 123) on the site of the former Union Iron Works (UIW)/Bethlehem Steel Shipyard (currently referred to as Pier 70). The subject buildings have been identified as contributing resources to the National Register-eligible Pier 70 Historic District. The subject lot is located within a M-2 (Heavy Industrial) Zoning District and 40-X Height and Bulk Limit.
Preliminary Recommendation: None - Informational

PRESENTERS: **Mark Paez**, Port's Historic Preservation Coordinator - presented a brief background of the project; **Mark Holbert**, Preservation Architect form Orton Development Inc. - presented program details on the rehabilitation and reuse of the buildings along 20th Street.

SPEAKERS: None

ACTION: None - Information Only

10. [2012.1523A](#) (RICHARD SUCRE: 415/575-9108)
151 LIBERTY STREET - located between Guerrero and Dolores Streets, Assessor's 3607, Lot 036A. **Request for a Certificate of Appropriateness** for exterior alterations, including the construction of a new two-car garage; façade alterations to accommodate a new residential entryway; construction of a new exterior stair, landing, and handrail on the primary façade; and, construction of a horizontal rear addition, a one-story vertical addition over an existing two-story portion, and a new roof deck. The subject lot is located within the Liberty-Hill Landmark District, a RH-3 (Residential, House, Three-Family) Zoning District and 40-X Height and Bulk Limit.

(Continued from November 6, 2103)

Preliminary Recommendation: Approve with Conditions

SPEAKERS: None

ACTION: Approved

AYES: Hyland, Johnck, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman, Wolfram, Hasz

MOTION: M-0219

11. [2013.0726H](#) (KELLY WONG: 415/575-9100)
200 CALIFORNIA STREET - north side between Front and Battery Streets. Assessor's Block 0237, Lot 006 - **Request for a Major Permit to Alter** to rehabilitate the building exterior. The project includes rehabilitating existing aluminum windows to accommodate operable sash, removing the clock tower at the corner bay above the roof line, staining existing sandstone cladding to a lighter color, and installing new roof top planters. 200 California Street was constructed in 1988 and deemed a Compatible Replacement Building under Section 1109(c) of the Planning Code. The subject building is a five-story reinforced concrete Renaissance Revival style building with tripartite composition, sandstone cladding, a prominent corner bay, and ornamentation at the cornice. The subject building is a Category V (Unrated) building and within the Front-California under Article 11 of the Planning Code.

Preliminary Recommendation: Approve with Conditions

PRESENTERS: + **Scott Brady** with Huntsman Architectural Group

SPEAKERS: = **Neil Mallot**, Historian - asked why this 1980 building is considered a historic building and why was the clock tower taken down.

ACTION: Approved

AYES: Hyland, Johnck, Johns, Matsuda, Wolfram, Hasz

NAY: Pearlman

MOTION: M-0220

12. [2011.0702F](#) (LILY YEGAZU: 415/575-9076)
101 POLK STREET - northwest corner of the intersection of Polk and Hayes Streets. Assessor's Block 0811, Lots 002 and 003 - **Request for Review and Comment** on the documentation and draft Memorandum of Agreement prepared by United States Department of Housing and Urban Development (HUD) for Section 106 review of the proposed residential project at 101 Polk Street. Consistent with Section 106 of the National

Historic Preservation Act, HUD has requested comments on the effects the proposed undertaking could have upon historic properties. The proposed project is the construction of a 13-story, 162-unit residential development including 19-units with 51 subterranean parking spaces. The 101 Polk Street project is acquiring a loan from HUD and as such the project constitutes an undertaking for which the lead agency is required to comply with Section 106 of the National Historic Preservation Act. The subject property is comprised of two vacant lots with approximately 13,200 square feet area and is currently used as a surface parking lot. The subject site is located adjacent to the Civic Center Historic District, which is a National historic Landmark (NHL) District, is listed in the National Register of Historic Places and is a designated local historic district under Article 10 of the Planning Code. The property is also located within a C-3-G (Downtown General Commercial) Zoning District and 120-X Height and Bulk District.

Preliminary Recommendation: Direct staff to draft written comments of the Commission to be forwarded to the US Department of Housing and Urban Development (HUD) and the State Office of Historic Preservation (SHPO)

PRESENTER: + **Marc Babsin**, Principal of Emerald Fund and Developer of the Project - presented project background information.

SPEAKERS: None

ACTION: Directed staff to draft a comment letter noting no adverse impacts

AYES: Hyland, Johnck, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman, Wolfram, Hasz

MOTION: L-0027

- 13a. [2013.1261U](#) (SUSAN PARKS: 415/575-9101)
50 CARMELITA STREET - east side of Carmelita Street between Waller and Duboce Streets. Assessor's Block 0864, Lot 011. **Consideration of adoption of a resolution** recommending Board of Supervisors approval of a Mills Act historical property contract. The Mills Act authorizes local governments to enter into contracts with owners of private historical property who, through the historical property contract, assure the rehabilitation, restoration, preservation and maintenance of a qualified historical property. In return, the property owner enjoys a reduction in property taxes for a given period. Designated as a contributor to the Duboce Park Landmark District under Article 10 of the Planning Code, the two-and-a-half-story frame house was constructed in 1899 in the Queen Anne style. The subject property is within in a RH-2 (Residential House, Two Family) Zoning District and 40-X Height and Bulk District.
Recommendation: Approve

SPEAKERS: None

ACTION: Adopted a Resolution Recommending Approval

AYES: Hyland, Johnck, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman, Wolfram, Hasz

MOTION: R-720

- 13b. [2013.1230U](#) (SUSAN PARKS: 415/575-9101)
66 CARMELITA STREET - east side of Carmelita Street between Waller and Duboce Streets. Assessor's Block 0864, Lot 015. **Consideration of adoption of a resolution** recommending Board of Supervisors approval of a Mills Act historical property contract. The Mills Act authorizes local governments to enter into contracts with owners of private historical

property who, through the historical property contract, assure the rehabilitation, restoration, preservation and maintenance of a qualified historical property. In return, the property owner enjoys a reduction in property taxes for a given period. Designated as a contributor to the Duboce Park Landmark District under Article 10 of the Planning Code, the one-and-a-half-story frame house was constructed in 1900 by master builder Fernando Nelson in the Queen Anne style. The subject property is within in a RH-2 (Residential House, Two Family) Zoning District and 40-X Height and Bulk District.

Recommendation: Approve

SPEAKERS: None
ACTION: Adopted a Resolution Recommending Approval
AYES: Hyland, Johnck, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman, Wolfram, Hasz
MOTION: R-721

- 13c. [2013.1260U](#) (SUSAN PARKS: 415/575-9101)
70 CARMELITA STREET - east side of Carmelita Street between Waller and Duboce Streets. Assessor's Block 0864, Lot 016. **Consideration of adoption of a resolution** recommending Board of Supervisors approval of a Mills Act historical property contract. The Mills Act authorizes local governments to enter into contracts with owners of private historical property who, through the historical property contract, assure the rehabilitation, restoration, preservation and maintenance of a qualified historical property. In return, the property owner enjoys a reduction in property taxes for a given period. Designated as a contributor to the Duboce Park Landmark District under Article 10 of the Planning Code, the one-and-a-half-story frame house was constructed in 1900 by master builder Fernando Nelson in the Queen Anne style. The subject property is within in a RH-2 (Residential House, Two Family) Zoning District and 40-X Height and Bulk District.
Recommendation: Approve

SPEAKERS: None
ACTION: Adopted a Resolution Recommending Approval
AYES: Hyland, Johnck, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman, Wolfram, Hasz
MOTION: R-722

- 13d. [2013.1258U](#) (SUSAN PARKS: 415/575-9101)
56 PIERCE STREET - east side of Pierce Street between Waller and Duboce Streets. Assessor's Block 0865, Lot 013. **Consideration of adoption of a resolution** recommending Board of Supervisors approval of a Mills Act historical property contract. The Mills Act authorizes local governments to enter into contracts with owners of private historical property who, through the historical property contract, assure the rehabilitation, restoration, preservation and maintenance of a qualified historical property. In return, the property owner enjoys a reduction in property taxes for a given period. Designated as a contributor to the Duboce Park Landmark District under Article 10 of the Planning Code, the two-and-a-half-story frame house was constructed c.1905 by master builder Fernando Nelson in the Queen Anne style and features applied stick work reminiscent of the Tudor style. The subject property is within in a RH-2 (Residential House, Two Family) Zoning District and 40-X Height and Bulk District.
Recommendation: Approve

SPEAKERS: None
ACTION: Adopted a Resolution Recommending Approval
AYES: Hyland, Johnck, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman, Wolfram, Hasz
MOTION: R-723

- 13e. [2013.1254U](#) (SUSAN PARKS: 415/575-9101)
64 PIERCE STREET - east side of Pierce Street between Waller and Duboce Streets. Assessor's Block 0865, Lot 015. **Consideration of adoption of a resolution** recommending Board of Supervisors approval of a Mills Act historical property contract. The Mills Act authorizes local governments to enter into contracts with owners of private historical property who, through the historical property contract, assure the rehabilitation, restoration, preservation and maintenance of a qualified historical property. In return, the property owner enjoys a reduction in property taxes for a given period. Designated as a contributor to the Duboce Park Landmark District under Article 10 of the Planning Code, the two-and-a-half-story frame house was constructed c.1905 by master builder Fernando Nelson in the Queen Anne style and features applied stick work reminiscent of the Tudor style. The subject property is within in RH-2 (Residential House, Two Family) Zoning District and a 40-X Height and Bulk District.
Recommendation: Approve

SPEAKERS: None
ACTION: Adopted a Resolution Recommending Approval
AYES: Hyland, Johnck, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman, Wolfram, Hasz
MOTION: R-724

- 13f. [2013.1259U](#) (SUSAN PARKS: 415/575-9101)
56 POTOMAC STREET - east side of Potomac Street between Waller and Duboce Streets. Assessor's Block 0866, Lot 013. **Consideration of adoption of a resolution** recommending Board of Supervisors approval of a Mills Act historical property contract. The Mills Act authorizes local governments to enter into contracts with owners of private historical property who, through the historical property contract, assure the rehabilitation, restoration, preservation and maintenance of a qualified historical property. In return, the property owner enjoys a reduction in property taxes for a given period. Designated as a contributor to the Duboce Park Landmark District under Article 10 of the Planning Code, the one-and-a-half-story frame house was constructed 1899 by neighborhood builders Moore & Olinger in the Queen Anne style. The subject property is within in a RH-2 (Residential House, Two Family) Zoning District and 40-X Height and Bulk District.
Recommendation: Approve

SPEAKERS: None
ACTION: Adopted a Resolution Recommending Approval
AYES: Hyland, Johnck, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman, Wolfram, Hasz
MOTION: R-725

- 13g. [2013.1257U](#) (SUSAN PARKS: 415/575-9101)
66 POTOMAC STREET - east side of Potomac Street between Waller and Duboce Streets. Assessor's Block 0866, Lot 015. **Consideration of adoption of a resolution** recommending Board of Supervisors approval of a Mills Act historical property contract. The Mills Act authorizes local governments to enter into contracts with owners of private historical property who, through the historical property contract, assure the rehabilitation, restoration, preservation and maintenance of a qualified historical property. In return, the property owner enjoys a reduction in property taxes for a given period. Designated as a contributor to the Duboce Park Landmark District under Article 10 of the Planning Code, the one-and-a-half-story frame house was constructed 1899 by neighborhood builders Moore & Olinger in the Queen Anne style. The subject property is within in a RH-2 (Residential House, Two Family) Zoning District and 40-X Height and Bulk District.
Recommendation: Approve

SPEAKERS: None
 ACTION: Adopted a Resolution Recommending Approval
 AYES: Hyland, Johnck, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman, Wolfram, Hasz
 MOTION: R-726

- 13h. [2013.0575U](#) (SUSAN PARKS: 415/575-9101)
1772 VALLEJO STREET - north side of Vallejo Street between Gough and Franklin Streets. Assessor's Block 0522, Lot 029. **Consideration of adoption of a resolution** recommending Board of Supervisors approval of a Mills Act historical property contract. The Mills Act authorizes local governments to enter into contracts with owners of private historical property who, through the historical property contract, assure the rehabilitation, restoration, preservation and maintenance of a qualified historical property. In return, the property owner enjoys a reduction in property taxes for a given period. Designated as Landmark #31 under Article 10 of the Planning Code, the three-story frame house was constructed 1875 in the Italianate style and features French Second Empire influences. The subject property is within in a RH-2 (Residential House, Two Family) Zoning District and 40-X Height and Bulk District.
Recommendation: Approve

PRESENTERS: + **Shannon Ferguson**, Senior Associates at Chattel Inc. - gave background information of the property; **John Moran**, Project Sponsor - to preserve and restore this home; **Mike Jai**, San Francisco Assessor Office - explained the three methods to value Mills Act Property.
 SPEAKERS: + **Mike Buhler**, SF Heritage - shared some history of the new Mills Act Application and stated this property could be a model for other that exceeds the \$3 Million valuation limit
 ACTION: Adopted a Resolution to recommend to the Board of Supervisors
 AYES: Hyland, Johnck, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman, Wolfram, Hasz
 MOTION: R-727

ADJOURNMENT: 3:05 PM