

**SAN FRANCISCO**  
**PLANNING COMMISSION**  
**RESOLUTION NO. 17590**

**ADOPTING FINDINGS RELATED TO THE RECOMMENDATION OF APPROVAL OF THE LANDMARK DESIGNATION OF THE TOBIN HOUSE (LOCATED AT 1969 CALIFORNIA STREET, ASSESSOR'S BLOCK 0649, LOT 016) AS A SAN FRANCISCO LANDMARK UNDER ARTICLE 10 OF THE PLANNING CODE.**

**WHEREAS**, on January 8, 2008, Brett Gladstone, of Gladstone and Associates, representing the subject property owners, submitted a Landmark/Historic District Designation Application prepared by Karen McNeill, PhD, of Carey & Company, initiating the designation of the Tobin House located at 1969 California Street on Assessor's Block 0649, Lot 016, as a Landmark pursuant to Section 1004.1 of the San Francisco Planning Code; and

Karen McNeill, PhD, of Carey & Company, prepared the landmark designation report for the Tobin House (**Attachment A**), and the Department of Recreation and Park's DPR 532(A) form (**Attachment B**). The property owner, Anthony Meier, reviewed the designation report and supports the designation of the Tobin House as a City landmark. Planning Department staff reviewed the report and prepared comments and opinions for the Landmarks Board; and

The Landmarks Preservation Advisory Board, at its regular meeting of March 19, 2008, reviewed the Landmark Designation Report for the Tobin House. The Landmarks Board found that the Designation Report describes the location and boundaries of the landmark site, describes the characteristics of the landmark that justify its designation, and describes the particular features that should be preserved, and therefore meets the requirements of Planning Code Section 1004(b) and 1004(c)(1). That Designation Report is fully incorporated by reference into this resolution; and

The Landmarks Board unanimously adopted Resolution No. 623, in which they recommended to the Planning Commission that they adopt a Resolution recommending that the Board of Supervisors adopt an ordinance to designate the Tobin House as a local San Francisco landmark pursuant to Article 10 of the Planning Code; and

The Commission held a duly noticed hearing at a regularly scheduled meeting on May 1, 2008 to consider the proposed Ordinance and the Landmarks Board's recommendation.

The Landmarks Preservation Advisory Board, in considering the proposed landmark designation employed the National Register of Historic Places criteria and found the Tobin House to be eligible for listing on the National Register under Register under Criterion B (Associated with the lives of persons significant in our past)), as well as Criterion C (Embodies the distinctive characteristics of a type, period, or method of construction, or that represent the work of a master, or that possess high artistic values, or that represent a significant and distinguishable entity whose components may lack individual distinction); and

The Landmarks Preservation Advisory Board reviewed and endorsed the following description of the characteristics of the landmark which justify its designation:

- a. 1969 California Street is a master architect-designed, three-story plus basement single-family

residence in the Tudor Gothic Revival style. It features sharply sloped slate shingle roofs with heavy copper coping and flashing as well as five partially exposed chimneys topped by clustered copper chimney pots. Gothic details on the façade lend the house character. They include a two-story angled bay with wood 14 and 12 light, arched casement windows. Scroll moldings surround the windows, and blind tracery extends above the ceiling line of each story. At the second story, just to the west of the bay, is a similar grouping of three pointed-arch casement windows. This façade also features a slightly recessed service door set in a plain pointed arch, and a deeply recessed main entryway set behind a Gothic pointed arch. A panel featuring a lion's head sits above the entry arch. A two-story Gothic pointed half arch completes the western end of the main façade. Character defining features of the west elevation include three leaded glass windows. A two-story bay with diamond-patterned leaded glass arched windows on the first floor, and a third-floor balcony with a copper capped wall comprise the dominant features of the south elevation. The Tudor Gothic style of this house is unique on this block of California Street, while the half arch makes the house unique in all of San Francisco. Just in front of the house, by its easternmost edge, stands a decorative concrete lamppost base. The concrete base, along with the narrow strip of land that currently serves as the driveway to 1969 California Street, is the only surviving artifact of the de Young estate, the residential compound built during the 1880s by one of San Francisco's most influential citizens during the half century spanning 1870 to 1920; and

The Landmarks Preservation Advisory Board reviewed and endorsed the following particular features that should be preserved:

- a. Stucco cladding;
- b. Gabled roof form with slate shingles;
- c. Copper chimney pots, flashing, and coping;
- d. Recessed main entry framed by a Gothic-arched opening at the front façade;
- e. Stucco panel above main entry with lion's head ornament;
- f. Recessed service door at front façade with inset panel and decorative ironwork over glazed, textured glass;
- g. Two-story angled bay window at the front facade with Gothic-arched, wood-framed, 12- and 14-light casement windows and blind tracery details within the spandrel panels above the first and second floors;
- h. Tri-partite, Gothic-arched, wood-framed, 12-light casement windows at the second floor of the front façade;
- i. Gothic-style scroll and hood moldings at windows and doors on front façade;
- j. Gothic half-arch at western end of front façade;
- k. Leaded glass windows at west and south facades;
- l. Second and third-story balconies and copper-capped balustrades at south façade;
- m. Third-story balcony and copper-capped balustrade at east façade;
- n. Decorative concrete lamppost base with inset panel and leaf pendant at front property line; and

The Landmarks Preservation Advisory Board found that the designation of the Tobin House meets the

required findings of Planning Code Section 101.1 in the following manner:

- a. The proposed Project will further Priority Policy No. 7, that landmarks and historic buildings be preserved. Landmark designation will help to preserve a significant historical resource that is associated with architecture that embodies the work of a master, and that embodies the tenets of the City Beautiful movement.
- b. The proposed project will have no significant impact to the other seven Priority Policies: the City's supply of affordable housing, existing housing, or neighborhood character, public transit or neighborhood parking, preparedness to protect against injury and loss of life in an earthquake, commercial activity, business or employment, or public parks or open space; and,

The Planning Commission concurs with the Landmarks Board's findings and its recommendation of approval of the landmark designation of the Tobin House.

The proposed landmark designation is consistent with the following General Plan Policies:

Urban Design Element

- |            |   |
|------------|---|
| POLICY 2.4 | Preserve notable landmarks and areas of historic, architectural or aesthetic value, and promote the preservation of other buildings and features that provide continuity with past development. |
| POLICY 2.6 | Respect the character of older development nearby in the design of new buildings.   |
| POLICY 2.7 | Recognize and protect outstanding and unique areas that contribute in an extraordinary degree to San Francisco's visual form and character.   |

*The proposed landmark designation would increase the protection of and outstanding and unique historical resource, thereby helping to better implement the above policies.*

The proposed amendments to the Planning Code are consistent with the eight Priority Policies set forth in Section 101.1(b) of the Planning Code in that:

1. That existing neighborhood-serving retail uses be preserved and enhanced and future opportunities for resident employment in and ownership of such businesses enhanced;  
*The proposed landmark designation will not impact such uses or opportunities.*
2. That existing housing and neighborhood character be conserved and protected in order to preserve the cultural and economic diversity of our neighborhoods;  
*The proposed landmark designation will not negatively impact existing housing or neighborhood character.*
3. That the City's supply of affordable housing be preserved and enhanced;  
*The proposed landmark designation will not negatively impact the City's supply of affordable housing.*
4. That commuter traffic not impede MUNI transit service or overburden our streets or neighborhood parking;  
*The proposed landmark designation will not impede transit service or overburden our streets of neighborhood parking.*

5. That a diverse economic base be maintained by protecting our industrial and service sectors from displacement due to commercial office development, and that future opportunities for resident employment and ownership in these sectors be enhanced;  
*The proposed landmark designation will not impact the diversity of economic activity.*
6. That the City achieve the greatest possible preparedness to protect against injury and loss of life in an earthquake;  
*The proposed Ordinance would not modify any physical parameters of the Planning Code or other Codes. It is furthermore not anticipated that the proposed Ordinance would result in any building activity and therefore would have no affect on the City's preparedness for an earthquake.*
7. That the landmarks and historic buildings be preserved;  
*Designating this significant historic resource as a local landmark will further a continuity with the past because the character-defining features of the building will be preserved for the benefit of future generations. Landmark designation will require that the Planning Department and the Landmarks Preservation Advisory Board review any proposed work that may have an impact on character-defining features. Both entities will utilize the Secretary of Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties in their review to ensure that only appropriate, compatible alterations are made. The proposed landmark designation will not have a significant impact on any of the other elements of the General Plan.*
8. That our parks and open space and their access to sunlight and vistas be protected from development;  
*The proposed Ordinance would not impact or facilitate any development which could have any impact on our parks and open space or their access to sunlight and vistas.*

**THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED** that the Planning Commission hereby recommends to the Board of Supervisors that it approve the proposed ordinance; and

I hereby certify that the foregoing Resolution was adopted by the Commission at its meeting on May 1, 2008.

Linda Avery  
Commission Secretary

AYES: Antonini, Lee, Moore, Olague, Miguel

NOES: None

EXCUSED: Sugaya